UPDATE

Infodemic management

FOR A STRONGER COVID-19 PANDEMIC RESPONSE AND BETTER PREPAREDNESS FOR EMERGING HEALTH THREATS

Tim Nguyen

Head of Unit High Impact Events Preparedness COVID-19 pillar lead Infodemic management, risk communication, RCCE



EPI•WiN



An infodemic makes it harder to manage the pandemic

- An infodemic is an overabundance of information – good and bad – that makes it difficult for people to make decisions for their health
- Misinformation¹ and disinformation² can cause real harm to health, public trust, and social cohesion – undermining the emergency response and extending the pandemic



We're not just fighting an epidemic; we're fighting an infodemic.

Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus Director-General, World Health Organization

¹ inaccurate information ² false or inaccurate information intended to mislead





nfodemic

The COVID-19 infodemic can harm health

- Access to reliable health information is a human right and public good – the infodemic is making it harder for people to find and understand health expert advice
- The infodemic can lead to confusion, risk-taking and harmful behaviours
- In some countries, misinformation has generated mistrust in governments, public health authorities and science





In Iran, approximately:

- 700 people have died
- 5,011 have been hospitalized and
- 90 have developed blindness or eyesight damage

after drinking methanol as a "cure" for coronavirus

Photo credits:

https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/04/iran-700-dead-drinking-alcohol-cure-coronavirus-200427163529629.html; https://www.cnn.com/us/live-news/us-coronavirus-update-04-24-20/h_d3b4da7f4ba4054207abe4cf783b10f4





nfodemic

Technology has changed the way information is produced, distributed and consumed



EPI•WiN



- An infodemic thrives online and offline, requiring a whole-of-society response across the global communication ecosystem
- Managing the infodemic has become more challenging with more rapid spread of mis- and dis-information through digital media
- Infodemic management will help us better manage this pandemic and more quickly tackle new and resurgent health threats

fodemic



How people receive, process and act on information varies



Illustration: Toby Morris, The Spinoff

Understanding how information originates, evolves and spreads through different platforms and channels is key to managing the infodemic

infodemic

EPI•WiN

orld Health

ganization

To manage the infodemic, we need an evidence-based framework, like that of epidemiologists

Infodemic management needs to be mainstreamed into public health preparedness and response plans because flattening the infodemic curve will help us to flatten the epidemic curve



EPI•WiN

ld Health

The right information at the right time, in the right format

- While it is not possible to completely eliminate, it *is* possible to manage the infodemic
- Infodemic management aims to ensure people have access to factual information in a timely manner that is easily understood; so they may rapidly adopt behaviours to protect health and the health of others during an epidemic
- Infodemic management must :
 - Be backed up by science
 - Rely on risk-based and evidence-based initiatives that empower communities to take action
 - Make use of best practices, including sharing experiences and continuous learning



EPI•WiN infode

Infodemic management interventions aim to influence health behaviour during epidemics



Infodemic interventions

- LISTEN TO CONCERNS
- **2** TRANSLATE SCIENCE & COMMUNICATE RISK
- **3** PROMOTE RESILIENCE TO MISINFORMATION
 - **ENGAGE & EMPOWER COMMUNITIES**

World Health Organization

EPI•WiN

infodemic M A N A G E M E N T Δ

LISTEN TO CONCERNS

Quantifying information through social listening

WHO uses a digital listening approach which analyses and quantifies information associated with COVID-19. For example, top keywords and topics are tracked in order to identify trends and help manage the infodemic.

Top topics by volume Report #56, 18 Feb - 24 Feb 2021



World Health Organization

EPI•WiN

LISTEN TO CONCERNS

EARS: AI-powered tool for automated digital listening in countries

Public tool for automated social listening and bespoke analytical platform for infodemic analysis



Early AI-supported Response with Social Listening

COVID-19 online conversations in 20 pilot countries

- Enable health information professionals to respond earlier to the infodemic to fill information voices and inoculate against misinformation with a real-time analysis of narratives of the general public.
- Building world-leading information infrastructure to serve countries to understand attitudes of the general public. Moving from surveys, to datapools and AI analytics that are real-time, flexible and locally adaptive.
- Covering 20 countries for piloting, data collected through *English, French, Spanish, Portuguese languages*

rld Health

EPI•WiN

intodem

SEE DATA FROM: Last 7 days Y All categories	Y	
What are people talking about?		
Overview across countries	¥ ()	Map Trend Intensity per country
Volume	Rising †	
7% industry	₽ 0.9%	
7% Personal measures	▶ 0.7%	
3% Current treatments	≠ 0.4%	
2% Vaccine distribution and policies on access	▶ 0.4%	
2% Disinformation	♪ 0.2%	
1% Non-proven treatments	▶ 0.2%	
3% The cause of the virus	▶ 0.2%	
2% Measures in public settings	▶ 0.2%	Proportion of this category of conversation compared to other categories in that country.
1% Digital Health Technology	▶ 0.1%	Rolling average of the last 7 days. No data 2% 27%
3% Demographic vulnerability & risks	≠ 0.1%	The limits reduce decomingtions and other information about in these shorts do not imply one independent on the part of
WITH CIFOX Proportion (%) and rising proportion (%) of the conversation.		the limits, cools, denominations and other information shown in these charts do not imply any judgment on the part of the WHO regarding the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of said limits.

<u>Link</u>

EARS case study: India (22.–28.02.2021)



Benchmark Analysis



identify outliers in various categories

Analysis 4

Covid-19 Vaccine: Raw Feed Analysis



Keyword 👻	Order by volume
1. covid	423 docs
2. vaccination	276 docs
3. vaccine	233 docs
4 . 19	226 docs
5. 1	154 docs
6. 60	150 docs
7. march	149 docs
8. 45	125 docs
9. comorbidities	92 docs

Analysis 3

Analysis 2

What are the most important terms?

Cluster Analysis

Important Keywords

Snapshot of Conversation: Covid-19 Vaccine

14:18 - Feb 24, 2021		18:26 - Feb 24, 2021
Jalandhar DC #GhanshyamThori briefs that registration of #covid19 vaccine for general population will start from 1st March for 60 plus age group and those who are 45 years plus but with co-morbidities. we appeal all	18:26 - Feb 24, 2021 Covid Vaccination Drive, Phase 2: How To Register Yourself To Get Coronavirus Jabs From Monday – All You Need To Know https://t.co/Dzw5r69ZQ0	Covid Vaccination Drive, Phase 2: How To Register Yourself To Get Coronavirus Jabs From Monday - All You Need To Know https://t.co/Dzw5r69ZQ0
• read more		
Autor Search Adv. M. And M. Sandar and	01:34 - Feb 24, 2021 🎽	11:33 - Feb 24, 2021 🎽 🎔
21:10 - Feb 24, 2021	India's Co-Win app will look at the	@MoHFW_INDIA
One-shot coronavirus vaccine by Johnson & Johnson is safe and effective, US FDA finds #southchinamorningpost #usnews #worldnews #ldiotPM https://t.co/a1eDgSIJXT	medical history of those who need to be vaccinated, especially elders and those who have comorbidities in the next phase of Covid-19 vaccination drive. https://t.co/M8yyfeRMKk	 @drharshvardhan Sir, we can use the existing infrastructure of CGHS Wellness Centres for Covid19 vaccination to Central Govt Employees. This will reduce load on Govt hospitals. Thank ● read more

US HCWs, COVID-19 & Vaccines: Network Overview



Public Health & Research Medical Specialists & HCWs Medical Advocacy Political Media Local Politics Right-wing Support & QAnon Left-Wing Music & Entertainment

Twitter network map showing accounts that engaged with a set of hashtags related to COVID-19 and vaccination in the US, for example: #CovidVaccine and #PfizerVaccine, between November 21 - December 21, 2020.

Main takeaways \rightarrow Next steps

1. HCWs are at the edges of the network maps – and there are fairly distinct clusters

 we need to identify influencers who can bridge socio-politically polarized groups to break out of echo chambers online (i.e., centrists)

2. HCW social media conversations are largely positive and apolitical though they are voicing frustration about rollout logistics, which can erode patient confidence

 we need to encourage prioritization of content shared, including encouraging positive reinforcement about what is going 'right' to help build vaccine confidence

3. Some instances of HCWs mocking people concerned about vaccines, which can further alienate those who are vaccine-questioning

- we need to support development of empathic engagement skills with training that is fast and easy (to avoid overburdening), foster norm-setting through professional networks, and consider incentives and positive reinforcement (e.g., awards for effective communicators)
- 4. Significant social media presence of nurses
 - priority group for engagement with customized content for rapid dissemination online and targeted talking points to help patients in-person better understand potential vaccine side effects to reduce rates of vaccine rejection

Translating science into protective measures

WHO video guidance on COVID-19

MASKS



Medical and fabric masks: who wears what when?



How to wear a	fabric
mask safely	

TRANSMISSION



How to break the chains of transmission



PROTECTING OURSELVES

NEW! Three factors help you make safer choices during COVID-19



How to wear a fabric mask



How to wear a medical mask



Seven steps to prevent the spread of the virus

How to protect yourself

against COVID-19





infodemic

PROMOTE RESILIENCE TO MISINFORMATION



Being resistant to misinformation requires an understanding of how information flows, but also understanding of cognition and behaviour

World Health Organization EPI·WiN

infodemic M A N A G E M E N T

Public Health Research Agenda for Managing Infodemics

- Infodemic management is an evolving area of research and practice. ٠
- The aim of the research agenda is to foster a coordinated and evidence-based approach ٠ to ensure better access to reliable and understandable health information so that individuals and communities can protect themselves during health emergencies.
- This includes developing new tools and approaches for inoculating against ٠ misinformation and promoting resilience to it.

Examples of questions we need to ask and answer:

- How do overwhelming amounts of information affect behaviour in emergencies and what interventions are effective in addressing it?
- How does online behaviour affect offline action?
- How does the infodemic affect cognition and influence seeking of health services? ٠
- How does the role of policy interventions successfully address and mitigate health misinformation? ٠
- How does the infodemic affect closed networks and vulnerable populations?

EPI•WiN

Link: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/339192/9789240019508-eng.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y







Public Health Research Agenda for Managing Infodemics, February 2021 5 research streams with 65 priority questions

Stream 1: Measure and monitor the impact of infodemics during health emergencies

- 1.1. Standardize taxonomies and classifications
- 1.2. Develop new metrics to measure and quantify infodemics
- 1.3. Analyse and triangulate data from multiple sources
- 1.4. Improve evaluation approaches for infodemic interventions.

Stream 2: Detect and understand the spread and impact of infodemics

- 2.1. Understand how information originates, evolves and spreads on different platforms and channels
- 2.2. Assess the role of actors, influencers, platforms and channels
- 2.3. Understand how misinformation affects behaviour in different populations

2.4. Develop regulatory and ethical principles to mitigate the spread and propagation of harmful health information.

Stream 3: Respond and deploy interventions that protect against the infodemic and mitigate its harmful effects

3.1 Design a behavioural change model applicable to infodemic management

EPI•WiN

3.2. Intervention design for different levels of action to mitigate the infodemics.

Stream 4: Evaluate infodemic interventions and strengthen the resilience of individuals and communities to infodemics

4.1. Develop interventions that address individual, community, cultural and societal factors affecting trust and resilience to misinformation

4.2. Understand and learn from the way misinformation has affected behaviour among different populations and in different contexts for specific infodemics

4.3. Identify factors associated with successful infodemic management by health authorities, the media, civil society, the private sector and other stakeholders.

Stream 5: Promote the development, adaptation and application of tools for managing infodemics

5.1. Use implementation research evidence in programme improvement and policy development

5.2. Promote evidence-based interventions and approaches between countries

5.3. Improve effectiveness and response times to the infodemic during acute health events.

Link: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/339192/9789240019508-eng.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y



WHO works with communities to protect health during epidemics

- WHO EPI-WIN has established representative groups from key communities (faith-based, youth, employers and workers) who communicate regularly with WHO and give input on projects and initiatives. Examples:
 - Co-development of practical guidance on COVID-19 education, preparedness and response to support faith-based organizations and faith communities
 - Collaborating with young people to design creative, engaging and relevant communication around 'reducing transmission of COVID-19'
 - Facilitating a virtual dialogue series together with leaders and representatives from the World of Work
- Since the beginning of the pandemic, WHO EPI-WIN has hosted 80
 COVID-19 related webinars with participants from 149 countries

Examples of youth entries for 'Reducing transmission' Design Lab





EPI•WiN infoc

ENGAGE & EMPOWER COMMUNITIES

Working together to support public health

infodemic

- Launched in June 2020, the Collective Service is a partnership between the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC), the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) and the World Health Organization (WHO). The Collective Service leverages active support from the Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network (GOARN) and key stakeholders from the public health and humanitarian sectors.
- The Collective Service works on risk communication and community engagement (RCCE) to ensure consistent, systematic and predictable support to partners involved in public health, humanitarian and development responses to the pandemic

EPI•WiN



World Health Organization

First global WHO infodemic manager training, November 2020

- 278 participants from 78 countries
- Various <u>lectures by infodemic management</u> <u>specialists</u> on topics such as:
 - Tools for analysis of the infodemic
 - Public health and epidemiology in context of infodemic response
 - Risk communication and community engagement

n context of inity FACTOR Y

CURRILULUM DEVELOPMENT

INFODEMIC MANAGER

UNICORNS

Link to training curriculum: https://www.who.int/teams/riskcommunication/infodemic-management/1stwho-training-in-infodemic-management

EPI•WiN

infodemic

World Health Organization

Other resources on infodemic management

WHO RESOURCES

- Infodemic management
 WHO infodemic management work and activities
 https://www.who.int/teams/risk-communication/infodemic-management
- <u>EPI-WIN updates</u> An archive of COVID-19 related weekly updates https://www.who.int/teams/risk-communication/epi-win-updates
- <u>3rd Virtual Global WHO Infodemic Management Conference</u>
 Whole-of-society challenges and solutions to respond to infodemics
 <u>https://www.who.int/teams/risk-communication/infodemic-management/3rd-virtual-global-who-infodemic-management-conference</u>

OTHER RESOURCES

- Sending SMS messages for the general public for COVID-19 response
 WHO, ITU and UNICEF are collaborating to facilitate sending short messages SMS to inform the general public about COVID-19 https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/ICT-Applications/Pages/COVID-19-public-SMS.aspx
- When old technology meets new: How UN Global Pulse is using radio and AI to leave no voice behind UN Global Pulse can offer speech to text (radio) listening https://www.unglobalpulse.org/2019/04/when-old-technology-meets-new-how-un-global-pulse-is-using-radio-and-ai-to-leave-no-voice-behind/
- UNESCO series on journalism education
 UNESCO medio/journalist training
 https://en.unesco.org/unesco-series-on-journalism-education

EPI•WiN







EPI•WiN



www.who.int/epi-win

infodemicmanagement@who.int