Learning and resilience in the Face of Adversity

February 12, 2015
2:00 - 3:30 PM

Fragility, Conflict and Violence Forum 2015
Presenters (World Bank Education Global Practice):
• Husein Abdul-Hamid, Senior Education Specialist
• Emanuella Di Gropello, Education Program Leader
• Joel Reyes, Education Resilience Specialist

Moderator: Harry A. Patrinos, Practice Manager, Education GP, World Bank

Discussants: Joan Serra Hoffman (Social, Urban, Rural and Resilience Group), Asbjorn Haland Wee (Fragility, Conflict and Violence CCSA)
Learning and resilience in the Face of Adversity

- UNRWA Education Program for Palestine Refugees
- MALI Strengths and Opportunities for Education Reform in the Midst of Crisis
- GLOBAL EXPERIENCES and the Development of the Education Resilience Framework
The UNRWA Education Program for Palestine Refugees

Resilience

- 500,000 refugee students a year
- 700 schools
- 17,000 staff
- Operates in West Bank, Gaza, Jordan, Lebanon, Syria
- Our report focuses on: West Bank, Gaza, Jordan
If and how learning happens in context of adversity?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAINSTREAM</th>
<th>RESILIENCE IN ADVERSITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACCESS</td>
<td>PROTECTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEARNING</td>
<td>STUDENT WELLBEING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EQUITY</td>
<td>COMMUNITY SUPPORT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SYSTEMS</td>
<td>RISK PREVENTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURRICULUM</td>
<td>ETC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEDAGOGY</td>
<td>(FCV Learning Mediators)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEACHERS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASSESSMENTS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Necessary but not sufficient in FCV Contexts)
Sequential mixed methods methodology design

Understand factors associated with the difference in student performance

Diagnostics and econometric analysis using learning data

Policy analysis using SABER

Analysis of classroom practices

Apply resilience framework

UNRWA over Public

Analyze system related issues to identify policy differences

Explore what is happening in the classroom

Linkages with processes and environment surrounding the learner

Lessons Learned
UNRWA Students Perform Well, Even after controlling for demographics

- Geographic location: 42
- Socioeconomic status: 40
- Gender: 39
UNRWA Students Perform Well, Even after controlling for characteristics
UNRWA Students Perform Well, after controlling for “soft” characteristics

- Teacher motivation/job satisfaction: 28
- Student motivation/self-confidence: 26
UNRWA Attracts & Recruits High Quality Teachers

- Clear expectations on teachers, guidance & mentoring
- More mandated on-going professional development & orientation
- Supported by well-qualified, well-prepared, experienced principals

... Concerning teachers, they always support us psychologically, teach us how to study, do our homework, help our mothers, set plans for exams and prepare our lessons. In general, they guide us to many useful ways concerning studying well.
UNRWA System Characteristics

Assessment & accountability system
UNRWA Classroom Characteristics

- Time on Task
- Student work on guided & graded tasks
- More in class assessment/quizzes
Process and Environment Characteristics

A community and culture of learning that supports child & makes education meaningful & relevant

- Risks face by students are acknowledged in schools and education is used as a protective asset
- The entire community protects students and support their learning (teachers, parents, neighbors, peers)
- School and community relations are fostered and sustained
- Education system services (curriculum, teacher training, school management) are aligned with a resilience process for protection and learning in the face of adversity
Lessons - Education Services and Resilience Alignment

A resilience approach can be aligned to what we know of effective education systems

Education systems benefit from...
• Attracting and Recruiting High Quality Teachers
• Effective Classroom Practices
• Assessment and Accountability

In contexts of adversity...
• Understanding further the process people follow to achieve a desirable outcome (e.g., learning):
  • Risks the face
  • Local strengths and opportunities
  • Context and interactions
Lessons - Systems and Systematic Support

Resilience is not about letting vulnerable communities to fend for themselves

• Education systems can combine mainstream education services, while promoting protection and wellbeing

• Fostering and using community assets (local strengths & opportunities) is crucial for learning in the face of adversity – and protecting students from risks
Mali Impact of the Crisis on Social Sectors: Education Resilience 360 Report

Resilience

• 350,000 Malians internally displaced due to the 2012 political and security crisis
• 54% of schools in the north became not functional
• No access for more than 100,000 students in the north
• 5,000 teachers displaced
Mixed methods methodology design: Education Resilience 360

- Secondary Data Review (available assessment, donor reports)
- Government Interviews and Secondary Data on Education Programs
- Policy and program analysis
- Adversity and Coping
- Risks and Assets
- Application of RES-360 Survey to Students, Families and School Staff
- Education and Crisis Context
- Services to Foster Education Resilience

Lessons Learned
Crisis affects various sectors together, requiring an integrated response

- Insecurity and Displacement
- Education System and Teachers
- Health and School Feeding
- Livelihoods
- Gender-Related Issues
- Limited System Response Capacity (fragility)
Educational Risks Were Growing in Communities hosting IDPs in Southern Mali

- Lack of *access*/*overcrowded* classrooms
- Overloaded *curriculum* and lack of qualified *teachers* to support IDP students
- *Language of instruction* in the South difficult for IDP students from the North
- Access problem for *girls* aggravated (for protection, taking care of family members, etc.)
- Psychosocial *trauma*
Financial problems, food insecurity and child labor risks increased in host/IDP communities

Students N = 270
Parents, Teachers and Principals N = 103
There was also evidence of local strengths and community support

- **Motivation associated with education**
  - In spite of the difficulties, there is still a strong desire to attend school.
  - Students feel protected by the school routine.

- **Support and solidarity of the host community**
  - Solidarity between community members
  - Friendships and camaraderie between displaced students and resident students
  - Language as an integrating factor (for displaced students)
  - Family support (the support of extended families and family friends; ideally the continuation of regular family life with both parents)

- **School-community mutual relations**
  - Community management (school–community relations)
  - Community participation (payments and contributions)
  - Administrative structure supplied by the school (routine plus the support that comes from being part of a system)

- **School staff support to community**
  - Displaced teachers organizing informal after-school classes
  - Engagement and commitment of teachers (required and voluntary)
  - Provision of financial support by head teachers
Community and school assets were available in host communities.

The Relative Availability of School and Community Assets, as Expressed by All Adults Interviewed (% of response)
Lessons - Education Programs that can be aligned to local assets

- Community-based school management and crisis prevention
- Flexible education programs
- Psychosocial support (whole school approaches, referrals and other services, and critical case management)
- Health and nutrition initiatives in schools & school meals programs
- Programs teaching job and market skills for youth; revenue-generating activities in communities and/or safety nets

- Education Demands and Motivation
  - Support and solidarity of the host community
  - School-community mutual relations and support
Development of the Education Resilience Approaches (ERA) Framework

- Can we combine mainstream education services with relevant interventions for learning in the face of adversity?
  - Growing evidence of physical and psychological trauma in students and educators
  - Schools becoming places of protection and learning or reproducing violence
  - “Positive Deviance” Examples Exist

Studies: UNRWA Student Learning, Mali Impact of the Crisis of Social Sectors, & Latin America Resilience Local Studies
**POLICY GOALS**

- **Manage and Minimize Risks**
  - What adversities students face
  - How the education system is addressing risks in schools

- **Use and Protect Local Assets**
  - How students seek resilience through competence and being accountable
  - How students seek resilience through socio-emotional well-being and engagement with others (peers, teachers, families, etc.)

- **Foster School-Community Support**
  - How schools provide protection and support along other education and community services
  - How school and community partnerships support students outcomes in adversity

- **Deliver resilience-aligned services**
  - How the education system provides strategic direction relevant to contexts of adversity
  - How education programs integrate learning, socioemotional well-being and protection
  - What are relevant human, material and financial resources for at-risk contexts

**RESILIENCE LEVERS**

- **Education As Protection in Adversity**
- **Local Assets and Opportunities**
- **School-Community Engagement**
- **Education Systems Support**

**Positive learning outcomes**

**Amid adversity**

**Education resilience process**

**Education resilience**
How Learning From UNRWA, Mali and other Local Studies Helped to Develop the ERA Framework?

Education Resilience Approaches (ERA)

www.worldbank.org/education/resilience
ERA Supported Local Research Teams

**Afghanistan**: Improving access to higher education for women

**Bhutan**: Improving access to schools in remote, rural communities

**Colombia**: Municipal education in the face of violent conflict

**Honduras**: Education resilience and violence risks in schools

**India**: Exploring education-related resilience of gender minorities

**Lebanon**: Education resilience and challenges of Syrian refugees

**Mali**: Resilience of displaced and host education communities

**Nicaragua**: Street children and resilience in schools

**Rwanda**: Institutionalizing resilience in a post-conflict context

**South Sudan**: Resilience research in a South Sudan university

**Nepal**: The learning process of displaced children living in slums

**West Bank, Gaza, and Jordan**: Learning of Palestinian refugees amid adversity
RES-Research Method: Resilience Research Training for Local Universities

Universities from Guatemala, El Salvador, Honduras and Colombia (Later South Asian Universities)

Local Universities and Researches Alliances + Mixed-Methods Research Training + Seed Funding for Local Studies + Various Cases Studies Available = Building Lessons Learned

Research Training Provided by the Bank and Resilience Research Center (Halifax)

Small Seed Funding (from US$ 2,000 – 15,000) to help with field work/data collection

12+ Case Studies on Education Resilience by Local Researchers (in contexts of adversity)

-Risks -Assets Communit & Schools Relevant services
Understand Context of Adversity and Local Risks Faced by Students

- Mutation from Armed Political Conflict to Youth Violence and Organized Crime
- Countries with Highest Homicide Rates in the World (Central America)
- Violence and Crime affecting children, youth and school settings
Pervasive violence across economic, social and political spheres

Post-conflict tensions remain (violent “peace”)

Pervasive violence across economic, social and political spheres

Latent or Hidden Risks

Varied manifestations of violence (micro and macro levels)

Non-addressed cognitive, social and emotional issues

CONTEXTS OF ADVERSITY
Understand Local Assets: Strengths and Opportunities

Nepal & Afghanistan

- Families provide emotional support (care and encouragement)
- Positive deviances and role models in the community (someone to look up to)
- Available and Accessible Services in the Community (NGOs, Faith Based, Govt. Programs)
ASSETS AND OPPORTUNITIES

Community Engagement

Student, Parent, Teacher and community assets

Opportunities for Learning and Socio-Emotional Wellbeing
Foster and Sustain the Inherent Value of Community Participation

**Mali and Central America**

- Extended Families and Neighbors as Sources of Support and Protection
- Education becomes a source of purpose not only for the individual but for the community
- Teachers role models and change agents in their communities
COMMUNITY, PARENTS & SCHOOL INVOLVEMENT

Parents in School Grade 1-9, Tegucigalpa, Honduras

School in Mali: Host and Displaced Community Members
Align Mainstream Education Services for Protection and Transformation

Palestine Refugees, Rwanda & Colombia

• Education policies with dual goals: academic and social transformation

• Education programs as catalytic for multiple efforts and interventions (self-defined programs, incentives for innovative approaches, etc.)

• Mainstream education inputs (curriculum, teacher training, school based management) explicit address risks and social change
ALIGNED MAINSTREAM SERVICES: Curriculum with Personal and Social Transformation Content

Colegio del Cuerpo [school of the body] Cartagena de Indias

Social Studies Content in UNRWA School in Gaza
ALIGNED MAINSTREAM SERVICES: Teaching and Learning Creatively

School in the West Bank
ALIGNED MAINSTREAM SERVICES:
Reflecting on Adversity Through Art

UNRWA School: Amman, Jordan
ALIGNED MAINSTREAM SERVICES:
Local Researchers & Universities

Resilience Research Training: South Sudan, Central America, and West Bank and Gaza
Manage and Minimize Risks
Use and Protect Local Assets
Foster School-Community Relations
Deliver resilience-aligned services

RESILIENCE ALIGNED EDUCATION POLICY GOALS

Amid adversity
Positive learning

Outcomes

Education resilience process
Dialogue Across Bank Groups

What does an Education Resilience Approach may mean for the World Bank?
For Discussion

- Do we understand how conflict and violence risks manifest in specific context?

- Do we know enough of the assets (strengths and opportunities) vulnerable groups have used to recover, function and even grow in the midst of adversities?

- Can these assets and opportunities be integrated within, or fostered by, mainstream education services?

- If education resilience happens in interactions between communities and schools, what does this mean for collaboration across Bank GPs and CCSAs?