



THE WORLD BANK



Evaluating Impact: Turning Promises to Evidence

Paul Gertler
University of California, Berkeley

Human Development
Network

East Asia and the Pacific
Region

Spanish Impact Evaluation
Fund



THE WORLD BANK



So you want to do an impact evaluation: Operational Issues

Human Development
Network

East Asia and the Pacific
Region

Spanish Impact Evaluation
Fund

The Last of Three Questions:



1. Why is evaluation valuable?
2. What makes a good impact evaluation?
3. **How to implement an impact evaluation?**



Implementation Issues

- Political economy
- Policy context
- Finding a good control
 - Retrospective versus prospective designs
 - Making the design compatible with operations
 - Ethical Issues
- Relationship to “results” monitoring



Political Economy

- What is the policy purpose?
 - In USA form national policy, defend budget
 - In RSA answer electorate
 - In Mexico allocate budget to poverty programs
 - In general, pressure to demonstrate budget effectiveness and rationale for scale up



Political Economy



□ Cultural shift

- From retrospective evaluation
 - **Look back and judge**
- To prospective evaluation
 - **Decide what need to learn**
 - **Experiment with alternatives**
 - **Measure and inform**
 - **Adopt better alternatives overtime**

□ Change in incentives

- Rewards for changing programs
- Rewards for generating knowledge
- Separating job performance from knowledge generation



The Policy Context



- Address policy-relevant questions:
 - What policy questions need to be answered?
 - What outcomes answer those questions?
 - What indicators measures outcomes?
 - How much of a change in the outcomes would determine success?

- Example:
 - Scale up pilot?
 - Criteria: Need at least a $X\%$ average increase in beneficiary **outcome over a given period**



The evaluation strategy depends on the rules of operations



- What is the identification strategy?
 - Depends on the implementation of the program

- Retrospective vs. Prospective

Retrospective Analysis

- Retrospective Analysis is necessary when we have to work with a **pre-assigned program** (expanding an existing program) and **existing data** (baseline?)

- Examples:
 - Randomization: Auditorias de corrupción (Brasil)
 - Regression Discontinuity: Bono Sol (Bolivia)
 - Difference in Differences: AGES (México)
 - Instrumental variables: Piso firme (México)

Prospective Analysis

□ Prospective Analysis

- The evaluation is designed in parallel with the assignment of the program
- Baseline data can be gathered

□ Example:

- Progresas/Oportunidades (México)

Prospective Designs

Use opportunities to generate good controls

- The majority of programs cannot assign benefits to all the entire eligible population
 - Budget limitations:
 - Eligible beneficiaries that receive benefits are potential treatments
 - Eligible beneficiaries that do not receive benefits are potential controls
 - Logistical limitations:
 - Those that go first are potential treatments
 - Those that go later are potential controls
- Not all eligible receive the program
 - Randomized Promotion



The Method depends on the rules of operation

		Targeted	Universal
In Stages	Without cut-off	Randomization	Randomized Rollout
	With cut-off	RD/DiD Match/DiD	RD/DiD Match/DiD
Immediately	Without cut-off	Randomized Promotion	Randomized Promotion
	With cut-off	RD/DiD Match/DiD	Randomized Promotion



Who gets the program?

□ Eligibility criteria

- Are benefits targeted?
- How are they targeted?
- Can we rank eligible's priority?
- Are measures good enough for fine rankings?

□ Roll out

- Equal chance to go first, second, third?



Ethical Considerations

- Do not delay benefits: Rollout based on budget/administrative constraints
- Equity: equally deserving beneficiaries deserve an equal chance of going first
- Transparent & accountable method
 - Give everyone eligible an equal chance
 - If rank based on some criteria, then criteria should be quantitative and public



Manage for results

- Prospective evaluation:
 - Tailor policy questions
 - Precise unbiased estimates
 - Use resources wisely:
 - Better methods
 - Cheaper data
 - Timely feedback and program changes
 - Improve results on the ground



Coordinate IE & Monitoring Systems



- Projects/programs regularly collect data for management purposes
- Typical content
 - Lists of beneficiaries
 - Distribution of benefits
 - Expenditures
 - Outcomes
 - Ongoing process evaluation
- Information is needed for impact evaluation



Evaluation uses information to:

- Verify who is beneficiary
- When started
- What benefits were actually delivered

Necessary condition for program to have an impact:

- benefits need to get to targeted beneficiaries



Overall Messages

- Impact evaluation useful for
 - Validating program design
 - Adjusting program structure
 - Communicating to finance ministry & civil society

- A good evaluation design requires estimating the counterfactual
 - What would have happened to beneficiaries if had not received the program
 - Need to know all reasons why beneficiaries got program & others did not



Design Messages

- Address policy questions
 - Interesting is what government needs and will use
- Stakeholder buy-in
- Easiest to use prospective designs
- Good monitoring systems & administrative data can improve IE

