Management Capacity Needs and Finance Systems for Inclusive Education

Welcome
AGENDA

• Conceptual Framework
  Mark Waltham

• Education Sector Analysis
  Natasha Graham

• Applying the ESA-IE in Ghana
  Rhoda Enchil

• Costing and Financing IE
  Beifith Kouak Tiyab

• Questions and Answers
  All

HOUSEKEEPING

• Closed captioning: https://c2cc.1capapp.com/event/unicef

• Use chat bar for questions or comments
Definition of Inclusive Education

- Exclusion
- Segregation
- Integration
- Inclusion
Getting all children into school

School

Community

Supply

Teachers

Infrastructure

Learning Materials

Demand

Attitudes

Costs

Benefits
Enabling all children to learn

Quality

Curriculum
Student Assessment
Learning Support
Conceptual framework

Service Delivery
- Teachers
- Infrastructure
- Learning Materials
- Curriculum
- Student Assessment
- Learning Support
- Attitudes
- Costs
- Benefits

Enabling Environment
- Laws & Policies
- Data & Evidence
- Leadership & Management
- Finance
Data on progress

Annual UNICEF survey of over 150 countries

- Law & policy
- Attitudes
- EMIS
- Materials
- Physical environment
- Human resources
Webinar Series: Disability-Inclusive Education in Africa

Education Sector Analysis
Chapter on Inclusive Education
A SOUND AND COMPREHENSIVE EXAMINATION OF THE EDUCATION SECTOR, AIMING TO INFORM SECTOR POLICY DIALOGUE AND PLANNING

What is Education Sector Analysis?

- Provides **evidence** on the **strengths** and the **weaknesses** using data/statistics from different sources
- Identifies the **main challenges for the sector** and provides **ways for improvement**
- Incorporates **all stakeholders** in order to build **consensus on key issues pertaining to education sector**
Core Dimensions Covered by ESA

Context issues
- Review of existing policies
- Review of main context issues that (may) affect education

Education sector performance
- Analysis of the sector performance
- Identification of main educational challenges
- Review of cost and financing issues
- Analysis of the system’s capacity to deliver results

External efficiency
- Analysis of the social impact of education
- Analysis of the economic impact of education
Core Dimensions Covered by ESA

- **Volume 1** covers six sector-wide chapters: 1/- context; 2/- enrollment, internal efficiency and OOSC; 3/- costs and financing; 4/- quality, system capacity and management; 5/- external efficiency; 6/- equity

- **Volume 2** covers four sub-sector chapters: 1/- ECD; 2/- Higher education; 3/- Literacy and non-formal education; 4/- TVET

- **Volume 3** covers four thematic chapters
  1. Inclusive education analysis (focusing on children with disabilities)
  2. Risk/vulnerability analysis
  3. Political economy/governance
  4. Institutional capacity analysis

- Countries are NOT expected to develop the 10 chapters! Chapters should be chosen “a la carte” based on the country needs/context and timeline in mind

Jointly developed by UNESCO-IIEP, the World Bank, UNICEF and GPE Secretariat
Education Sector Analysis – INCLUSIVE EDUCATION
Inclusive Education Conceptual Framework

**SERVICE DELIVERY**

**Supply**
- Teachers
  - Initial and in-service training
  - Pedagogical support
  - Classroom support
- Infrastructure
  - Classrooms and playgrounds
  - Toilets and washing facilities
  - Transport to and from school
- Learning Materials
  - Braille and audiobooks
  - Sign language resources
  - Easy read versions

**Quality**
- Curriculum
  - Relevance
  - Flexibility and adaptability
  - Exam accommodations
- Student assessment
  - Screening
  - Referrals
  - Continuous learning assessment
- Learning support
  - Assistive products
  - Individual learning plans
  - Individual support

**Demand**
- Attitudes
  - Teachers and administrators
  - Parents and communities
  - Peers and other students
- Costs
  - Direct and hidden costs
  - Additional support costs
  - Opportunity costs
- Benefits
  - Opportunities for progression
  - Social inclusion and citizenship
  - Economic empowerment

**ENABLING ENVIRONMENT**

- Laws & Policies
  - Constitutional provisions
  - International conventions
  - Rules and regulations
  - National strategies
- Data & Evidence
  - Definitions of disability
  - EMIS and other databases
  - Household Surveys
  - Research studies
  - M&E and inspection
- Leadership & Mgmt
  - Management capacity at central, sub-national and school levels
  - Procedures and compliance
  - Cross-sectoral coordination
  - Partnerships including DPOs
- Finance
  - Allocation to mainstream system
  - Allocation to targeted support
  - Resources from other sectors
BAKING A CAKE VS. ANALYZING EDUCATION SYSTEM

**Ingredients**
- Education Sector Analysis Core Components
- Context
- Existing Policies
- Cost and Finance
- Education System Performance
- System Capacity
Looking at the Education System Through an Inclusive Lens

- Laws and Policies
- Data and Evidence
- Teachers
- Leadership and Management
- Curriculum
- Learning materials
- Infrastructure
- Student assessment
- Finance
- Cost
- Attitudes
- Risks and rewards
- Learning support
Education Sector Analysis – Inclusive Education

1. Overview of inclusive education for children with disabilities – definitions, concepts and principles

2. Disparities in access and learning achievement for children with disabilities

3. Laws and policies for inclusive education for children with disabilities

4. System capacity and management

5. Early learning

6. Demand side issues

7. Costs and financing

- Why inclusive education of children with disabilities important?
- Definition and classification of disability: what is disability?
- Out of School Children
- Data sources and OOSC computations
- “Invisible” children with disabilities
- Analysing the legal policy context
- Assessing the broader legislative environment
- Assessment of system capacity to implement IE
- Access
- Curricula
- Aids and adaptations
- Assessment
- Teacher training
- Attitudes and beliefs
- Financial barriers
- Partnering with non-state actors
- Analysing expenditures on education for children with disabilities
- Tools
- Questionnaires
- Check lists
- Examples from other countries
1. **Timing** – in line with development of the new Education Section Plan;

2. **Commitment** – Ghana had a newly developed IE policy and showed strong commitment to do more;

3. ‘Learning by doing’ - the global team worked closely with the Ghanaian MOE to validate, test and adapt the ESA approach and methodology.
GHANA: ESA-IE Analytical Domains

Policy & System Capacity
- Assessment of national laws and policies on inclusive education
- Assessment of system capacity to implement the law and policies

Capturing “disability” in data
- EMIS
- Population Census 2010
- Living Standard and Measurement Survey 2013
- Data collected by Inclusive Education Monitoring Tool in 20 UNICEF project districts

Costing & Finance
- Current financing of inclusive education
- Current cost of inclusive education
Applying the ESA-IE in Ghana

PRESENTED BY: RHODA ENCHIL, UNICEF (GHANA)
Policy & System Capacity
- Assessment of national laws and policies on inclusive education
- Assessment of system capacity to implement the law and policies

Capturing “disability” in data
- EMIS
- Population Census 2010
- Living Standard and Measurement Survey 2013
- Data collected by Inclusive Education Monitoring Tool in 20 UNICEF project districts

Costing & Finance
- Current financing of inclusive education
- Current cost of inclusive education

GHANA: ESA-IE Analytical Domains
ESA-IE in Ghana: Highlights

- Ghana is transitioning from the segregation model to an inclusion model.

**Enabling Environment**
- Different levels of progress and achievements across key elements

- Ghana’s IE Policy is one of the best in sub-Saharan Africa

- Data is available but can be strengthened (EMIS and Household surveys capture some level of data on CwD)

- Weak system capacity – when supported can be strengthened

- Financing is inadequate to support the implementation of Ghana's IE Policy
The policy is currently aspirational and is formulated with an ideal system capacity in mind.

The overall legislative environment is conducive for the implementation of inclusive education.

Ghana’s IE policy has been domesticated from international conventions.

Ghana’s legal and policy framework presented a good entry point for the ESA-IE work and had an overall score ranging between 3 (well established) and 4 (champion)!!
Availability of data/Trends

- **Overall Prevalence Rates (KG-SHS)**
  - Population census= 1.6%
  - EMIS =0.4%
- There are large number of children with disabilities already studying in regular schools (1.7% of total students screened in KG and Primary) in 20 districts
- **Types of Disabilities captured by EMIS:**
  - Visual, Hearing, Physical, Intellectual, Multiple Disabilities

![Prevalence rate by age-group/gender](image)

Source: Population Census 2010
### Teachers' Knowledge on Inclusive Education: Survey in 9 Selected Districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Knowledge of Teachers</th>
<th>Knowledge of Non-Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessing, testing or evaluating the learning of children...</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with speech, language, or communication...</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners who are gifted...</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with deafblindness...</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with intellectual disabilities</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with multiple disabilities</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with physical disabilities</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with autism</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners with learning disabilities</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners who are deaf or hard of hearing</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners who are blind or have low vision</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the needs of learners seen as having behavioural problems</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using varied learning activities to engage a diverse range of learners</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
District GES officials knowledge on IE policies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Weak</th>
<th>Initiating</th>
<th>Established</th>
<th>Championing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afram Plains</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asokore Mampong Municipal</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Builsa</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cape Coast</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dormaa West</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jirapa</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Komenda/Edina/Egwafo/Abirem</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dayi (New)</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Savelugu/Nanton Municipal</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Perception of Parents

Reason why I am not comfortable with my child learning with a CWD

- A taboo in the community: 0%
- Slow down learning of regular student/pupils in the classroom: 29%
- Fear of regular children being infected: 43%
- Others: 29%

- My child's teacher makes him or her feel welcome in the classroom: 91%
- My child feels accepted by his/her classmates: 85%
- Teachers have been trained to support CWDs to participate successfully in learning: 91%
- The school has the appropriate TLMs to support all learners: 71%
Glaring gaps and next steps……

GAPS

• Weak system capacity to support IE implementation
• Inadequate quality data impedes implementation plans
• Findings of ESA –IE mainstreamed in Ghana’s 2018-2030 ESP

Next Steps

• Supporting CSOs/NGOs on advocacy on IE policy and engagement with government on improved resource allocation.
• Bridging the gap between segregation and inclusion
• Curriculum reforms (tertiary and pre-tertiary) addresses inclusivity issues
‘ALL MEANS ALL……..EVERY CHILD MATTERS’

THANK YOU
COSTING AND FINANCING INCLUSIVE EDUCATION:

An overview

Presented by:

Beifith Kouak Tiyab, IIEP – Pole de Dakar
b.kouak-tiyab@unesco.org
https://poledakar.iiep.unesco.org/en
Why it is important to cover financing issues

**IMPLEMENTATION PURPOSE** – Difficult to promote implementation of IE without knowing:
- How much it costs
- How it gets funded

**BUDGET CONSTRAINTS** – Education budgets often limited, and in less developed education system (such as in Africa), priorities may be elsewhere than on IE, children with disabilities being often last in line for support.
Why it is important to cover financing issues

EDUCATION BUDGETS NOT SENSITIVE TO INCLUSIVE EDUCATION
- More than half of LMICs (45 out of 76) do not have specific budget allocation for children with disabilities or for special education (Review from Development Finance International, 2016)

SUSTAINABILITY CONCERNS – While providing IE is the responsibility of the States, reviews show that in a great number of developing countries, development partners are the major source of funding via projects, questioning then the sustainability of the supports
How to cost disability-inclusive education?

**TWO MAIN ASPECTS TO CONSIDER**

**Requirements for Inclusive Education**
- Early Assessment
- Assistive devices
- Teaching and learning materials
- Teachers training or capacity building
- Infrastructures upgrading
- Etc.

**Unit cost attached to each item**
- Cost of early assessment per child
- Unit Cost of assistive devices by type of disability
- Unit cost of teaching & learning materials for all children, including the additional ones resulting from the inclusion of CwD, by type of disability
- Etc.

**TOTAL COST OF DISABILITY-INCLUSIVE EDUCATION**
- Recurrent cost
- Capital cost
How to cost disability inclusive education?

 굉장히 중요한 것은, 접근의 요건을 정확하게 파악하는 것이며, 아래의 요소들을 포함시켜야 한다.

- Unit costs should reflect reality and take into account context specificities, so as to make the costing reliable. May be useful to cross:
  - Standardized and official unit cost
  - Market prices
  - Unit cost from pilot experiences
How to cost disability-inclusive education

REQUIREMENTS TO DISABILITY-INCLUSIVE EDUCATION, BASED ON GHANA EXPERIENCE…

1. Early Assessment
   - Basic screening
   - Further diagnosis

2. Assistive devices
   - Identified by type of disability

3. Accessibility of infrastructures
   - For existing building: upgrading with additional ancillary facilities
   - For new building: cost of all ancillary facilities included

4. Sensitization
   - Children without disabilities
   - Communities

5. Capacity building of teachers
   - To conduct basic screening
   - To take in charge children with disabilities in their classrooms

6. Teaching and learning materials
   - Identified by type of disability

7. Curriculum & Assessment
   - Cost of curriculum revision/adaptation
   - Cost of assessments review

8. Social interventions
   - Feeding grants
   - Uniforms
   - Exercise textbooks
However, financing is not yet adequate to support full implementation of IE policy.

In 2015, inclusive education accounted only for 0.6% of the total education recurrent expenditures, while the needs are much higher as per IE policy.
How to finance inclusive education?

**Government budget**

*Targets recommended: At least:*
- 4-6% of GDP to education
- 20% of public expenditure to education

*BUT* many SSA countries are still far from these targets

**External funding**

*Targets recommended:*
- 0.7% of GDP for Official Development Assistance

*BUT* International aid to education is declining...

**Private funding**

(HH, communities, companies, etc.)

Not target, but HH = significant contributor to education financing

*However, expanding their contribution can affect negatively IE, as CwD come from the poorest HH.*

**TOTAL RESOURCES FOR EDUCATION**

Need of sustainable and innovative financing for education, reaching all and leaving no one behind...
How to finance inclusive education?

Common agreement that **NOT POSSIBLE TO ENSURE SUSTAINABLE FINANCING OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION WITHOUT:**

- **Increasing domestic financing:** sustainable financing of IE needs to come from domestic resources
- **Evolving towards inclusive-responsive budgeting:** education budgets should be aiming to improve and maintain the whole system with inclusive lens
- **Ensuring efficient use of existing resources:** a greater financing of IE is not only the result of increasing resources, but also a strategic use of existing resources
- **Ensuring budget transparency and accountability mechanisms:** Better accountability provide credibility for other stakeholders (private sector, donors, etc.) on where and how to invest to fill the funding gaps for inclusive education
IIEP – POLE DE DAKAR
MERCI BEAUCOUP