Primary objective of PWs is to provide source of income through temporary employment, thereby smoothing consumption and reducing poverty.

Public works programs also achieve important secondary outcomes in terms of the creation of public goods such as generation of infrastructure, land management and services.

Evolving “public works plus” approaches link basic safety net function with longer term opportunities via entrepreneurship & skills training, also provision of services.
## The Global View

### Scale and Attributes of Selected Public Works Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country, program</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Number of beneficiaries</th>
<th>Timing</th>
<th>Payment modality</th>
<th>Female participation (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia, Productive Safety Net Program</td>
<td>Active since 2005</td>
<td>7.6 million people (2009)</td>
<td>Year-round</td>
<td>Cash and food</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh, Employment Generation Program for the Poorest</td>
<td>Active since 2009</td>
<td>120,000 people (2009)</td>
<td>Seasonal, 4 months</td>
<td>Cash</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India, Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme</td>
<td>Active since 2006</td>
<td>54.9 million households (2011)</td>
<td>Year-round</td>
<td>Cash</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia, Workplaces with Stipend Emergency Public Works Program</td>
<td>Closed</td>
<td>67,800 people (2010)</td>
<td>Year-round</td>
<td>Cash</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Main Rationale

![Bar chart showing the number of programs across different income levels. The categories include Low income, Lower-middle income, and Upper-middle and high income. The chart includes different types of programs such as Bridge to self-employment, Reintegration into labor market, Antipoverty, Employment guarantee, Seasonal, and One-time shock.]
Different Models and Approaches

- **Primary objective**
  - **Mitigation of Covariate Shocks**
  - **Mitigation of Idiosyncratic Shocks**
  - **Poverty Relief and Food Security**
  - **Bridge to More Permanent Employment**

- **Model**
  - **Short-Term Safety Net** (e.g., Egypt)
  - **Longer-Term Safety Net** (e.g., Ethiopia, India)
  - **Public Works Plus** (e.g., Djibouti)
Design, Implementation & Evidence

- **DESIGN**
  - Targeting methods
  - Benefit levels, wage setting
  - Institutional aspects, and funding
  - Project selection
  - Additional features, graduation

- **IMPLEMENTATION LOGISTICS**
  - Beneficiary selection
  - Project selection
  - Management information
  - Financial reporting
  - Worksite management
  - Communications
  - Procurement
  - M&E

- **EVIDENCE**
  - Technical assessments, audits
  - Impact Evaluation
  - Transparency and Accountability

Note: The panel discussion will discuss these elements in more depth – the following slides provide some high level framing on key terms and issues.
Selected Issues: Targeting

• Geographic targeting
  – From regional to local

• Individual targeting
  – Self selection – Wage rate
  – Community selection
  – Reservations: e.g., quotas for women
  – Administrative selection based on criteria that predicts household’s poverty (proxy means tests: targeting presentation)
Selected Issues: Benefit Setting

• The level of the wage rate is critical for determining distributional outcomes,

• A number of options exist for determining the level of the wage rate:
  – Keep it below the ruling market wage *
  – Keep it equal to the minimum wage
  – Keep it higher than the market wage

• In case of first option, self-selection is possible and inclusion errors could be avoided, but does not guarantee avoidance of exclusion errors especially if the program is over-subscribed

• Country circumstances vary a great deal; not all countries succeeded in the first option; not surprisingly varied experience – so additional targeting mechanisms required
Selected Issues: Project Selection

• Project Selection Criteria
  – Selection of the type of project depends on: objectives, share of labor cost, timing and duration, and potential to encourage participation of women, youth, and people with disabilities.
  – Public Works implemented as safety nets emphasize labor-intensive projects to maximize beneficiaries: Labor: Capital ratio in range 0.7:0.3
  – Environmental and social safeguard requirements need to be met to ensure that programs do not adversely affect the environment and human well-being.

• Integration of Additional Objectives through Public Works Plus
  – Training, financial inclusion and linkage to financial services.
Sample of Project activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of project</th>
<th>Project/activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Economic infrastructure      | Transport sector: rural and urban roads, feeder roads, pedestrian bridges, bus stops, sidewalks, culverts, etc.  
Marketplace: public market places including facilities, parking lots, latrines, helipads, and market yards  
Gas and electricity: installation of electricity cables, gas network systems, etc.  
Irrigation systems: irrigation canals and drains, etc.  
Other productive infrastructure |
| Sanitary infrastructure      | Drinking water: community water supply networks, etc.  
Storm water: erosion control structures (e.g., gabions, reno mattresses), infiltration pits, etc.  
Wastewater and solid waste: sewerage networks, latrines, disposal pits, etc. |
| Social infrastructure        | Health infrastructure: community clinics, hospitals, etc.  
Educational infrastructure: schools, libraries, training facilities, etc.  
Recreational infrastructure: theaters, parks, playgrounds, etc.  
Other services infrastructure: public showers, housing, etc. |
| Land management and environmental | Land productivity and availability and soil fertility restoration: gully control, hillside terracing, harmful tree removal, etc.  
Soil and water conservation projects: afforestation, tree nurseries, flood control structures, etc.  
Fodder availability: vegetative fencing and fodder belts, fodder seed collection, etc. |
| Social services              | Operation of child care centers and nursing homes, training, garbage collection, street sweeping, etc. |


## Stylized overview: PWs IE Evidence Base


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes Of Interest</th>
<th>Impact</th>
<th>Evidence (* weak, ** moderate, *** good, **** strong)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consumption and income smoothing</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>****</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Security</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livelihoods</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asset Generation</td>
<td>+/-?</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Market reintegration</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Cohesion</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

?: unclear ; n/a : not available

*Although many qualitative and light assessments also available e.g. Sri Lanka, Liberia, Sierra Leone crisis*
## Political Economy Aspects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Important counter-cyclical interventions.</td>
<td>• They can be an expensive way to transfer resources to the poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Popular public support as “Productive” investment</td>
<td>• Administratively demanding – must be well designed and implemented, materials must be selected and procured properly, and work must be supervised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Mechanism of realizing “right” to work, and earn livelihood.</td>
<td>• Public works tend to suffer from leakages of resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Can provide community wide benefits: asset building, cohesion.</td>
<td>• Countries may often have mixed (bad) record in implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Complement growth (via infrastructure buildings, supporting small scale contractors)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Welcoming our Panel:
Sarah Coll-Black, Suleiman Namara, Endeshaw Tadesse