Delivering Safety Nets: A Framework

John Blomquist
World Bank
October 29, 2019
This Morning’s Outline

- What are delivery systems in social protection
- The delivery chain and enabling information technology
- The delivery chain summary (the “Sourcebook”)
- Selected trends and key messages
Countries offer a range of risk management policies and programs to help households manage shocks to livelihoods, reduce poverty and improve equity. These occur across the life cycle of individuals. (The “what”)

Delivery systems are the processes and methods by which programs are actually implemented. They cut across the types of programs. (The “hows”)
Given diverse needs, many countries offer many social protection 
benefits & services to various groups along the life cycle.
All Benefits and Services Have a Similar Delivery Chain

1. Assess
   Potential Demand

2. Enroll

3. Provide

4. Monitor & Manage

   Recurring Cycle

- Assess
  Potential Demand
- Enroll
- Provide
- Monitor & Manage

Recurring Cycle
All Benefits and Services Have a Similar Delivery Chain

1. Outreach
2. Intake & Registration
3. Assess Needs & Conditions

Assess

Potential Demand

4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
5. Determine Benefits & Service Package
6. Notification & Onboarding

Enroll

Provide

7. Benefits and/or Services

Recurring Cycle

Monitor & Manage

8. Beneficiaries
9. Grievances
10. Compliance
11. Exit Decisions
12. Notifications
13. Case Outcomes

Periodic Re-Assessment
People & Institutions interact all along the delivery chain.

Communications, Information Systems, and Technology can all serve as enablers to help intermediate among them.
The Challenge of Fragmentation
Information systems as enabling factors all along the delivery chain

1. Outreach
2. Intake & Registration
3. Assess Needs & Conditions
4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
5. Determine Benefits & Service Package
6. Notification & Onboarding
7. Benefits and/or Services
8. Monitor & Manage
9. Recurring Cycle

Foundational Technology Platforms for Social Protection and Beyond

- Foundational ID Platform
- Payments Platform
- Social Registry Platform
- GIS Platform
- Civil Registry
- Compliance Monitoring
- Data Analytics Platform
- Grievance Redress
- Beneficiary Management
- Operations Management & Process Automation underpinning Delivery of SP benefits/services

Whole-of-Government Interoperability & Data Protection Framework

Operations Management & Process Automation underpinning Delivery of SP benefits/services
Useful Tool: “Swim Lanes” Delivery Chain Process Maps: Clarity of Institutional Roles & Sequencing of Steps

1. Go to ESO to register as unemployed
2. Review documents, certify UWOI declaration
3. Go to SSO to pick up UA application
4. Provide application form, checklist, information on UA process
5. Fill out application, gather docs, go to SSO to submit application
6. Enter data into UNISO, scan documents, cross-check information
7. Go to SSO for interview on scheduled date
8. Conduct interview, obtain consent form, explain next steps
9. Assess client profile; submit profile to MoSA via UNISO
10. UNISO verifies client data, and automatically checks eligibility and computes benefits for UA and other benefits
11. Enrollment Decision
12. Receives MoSA’s decisions, sends notifications to applicants
13. Receive notification; if approved go to ESO
15. Start job search, record efforts in Jobseeker Logbook
16. File 1st benefit claim at SSO
17. Check client information, verify compliance in job-search logbook; submit reviewed benefit claim to MoSA
18. Reviews benefit claims, authorizes payment and sends payment order to post office (not shown), which then sends the check to clients in the mail
19. Receives 1st Payment, Go to ESO
20. Continue job search, Go to ESO
21a. Monthly service appointment with client: provide Job Search Assistance, referrals
21b. Monthly service appointment with client: provide Job Search Assistance, referrals
22. Record service visit in Jobseeker logbook
23. File 2nd benefit claim at SSO
24. Check client information, verify compliance in job-search logbook; submit reviewed benefit claim to MoSA
25. Reviews benefit claims, authorizes payment and sends payment order to post office (not shown), which then sends the check to clients in the mail
26. Receives 2nd Payment, continues job search activities & recording in logbook

Repeat: 20-26
Scenario 1: Katia’s Experience Applying for UA Benefits with Job Search Requirements

**Experiences:** Negative to Positive

- Distraught
- Frustrated with bureaucracy; worried about using up savings to pay bills

**“Doing:** Steps, Actions, Touchpoints

1. Learn about UA through friends
2. Take bus to ESO, Walk to SSO; Long lines at both offices.
3. Go to ESO, Create Jobseeker profile on self-service kiosk; Print Jobseeker number; Pickup Jobseeker Logbook
4. Go back to SSO twice to inquire about status of her application. Missed notification? Search for a job...
5. Go back to SSO to file Benefit Claim
6. Go back to SSO for interview
7. Go back to SSO to submit Application
8. Discouraged by process; worried about using up savings to pay bills

**TCV**

- 4 + 3 hours
- $4 bus fare
- 2 visits

- 18 hours
- $16 bus fare
- $10 notary fees
- 4 trips

- 3 hours
- Long walk
- 1 visit

- 6 hours
- Long walk
- 1 visit

- 3+3 hours
- Long walk
- 2 visits

- 4 + 3 hours
- $4 bus fare
- 2 visits

- 3+3 hours
- Long walk
- 2 visits

- 63 days after losing job...

**“Feeling:** Highs, Lows, Painpoints

- Frustrated with bureaucracy; worried about using up savings to pay bills
- Distraught
- Humiliated

**Journey Mapping Tools: Anais’ Experience applying for UA Benefits with Job Search Conditions**

**Doing:** Steps, Actions, Touchpoints

- Learn about UA through friends
- Take bus to ESO, Walk to SSO; Long lines at both offices.
- Go to ESO, Create Jobseeker profile on self-service kiosk; Print Jobseeker number; Pickup Jobseeker Logbook
- Go back to SSO twice to inquire about status of her application. Missed notification? Search for a job...
- Go back to SSO to file Benefit Claim
- Go back to SSO for interview
- Go back to SSO to submit Application
- Discouraged by process; worried about using up savings to pay bills

**TCV**

- 4 + 3 hours
- $4 bus fare
- 2 visits

- 18 hours
- $16 bus fare
- $10 notary fees
- 4 trips

- 3 hours
- Long walk
- 1 visit

- 6 hours
- Long walk
- 1 visit

- 3+3 hours
- Long walk
- 2 visits

- 4 + 3 hours
- $4 bus fare
- 2 visits

- 3+3 hours
- Long walk
- 2 visits

- 63 days after losing job...
Structure of the “Sourcebook”

Chapter 1: Introduction

Chapter 2: Overview of the social protection delivery systems framework, including delivery chain, actors (clients, institutions, interface) and enabling factors (communications, information systems and technology)

Chapter 3: Assess Potential Demand

Chapter 4: Intake & Registration, Assess Needs & Conditions

Chapter 5: Enroll

Chapter 6: Benefits

Chapter 7: Services

Chapter 8: Recurring Cycle

Chapter 9: Measuring, Monitoring & Evaluating the Performance of SP Delivery Systems

Chapter 10: Conclusions and Future Directions in Delivery Systems

Glossary of Terms
Mainstreaming Groups & Programs Across the Sourcebook

Demographic Groups:
e.g., Children, Elderly

Categorical Programs:
e.g., Child Allowances, Social Pensions

Socio-Economic Groups:
e.g., Poor, Low-Income

Programs Targeted by Socio-Economic Status:
e.g., UCTS, CCTs, public works, labor benefits, social services, health insurance subsidies, needs-based scholarships, housing & utility benefits, etc.

Individuals Classified by Labor-Force Status:
e.g., Unemployed, Job-Seekers

Labor Benefits & Services:
e.g., Unemployment Insurance & Assistance, Employment Services, ALMPs, activation packages

Disabled Persons:
Moderate vs Severe; Short-Term vs Long-Term

Benefits & Services for the Disabled:
e.g., Disability Insurance & Assistance; Social-Care Services

Individuals Facing Social Risks:
e.g., Children, Youth, Adults, Elderly

Social Services:
e.g., Social Work Services (information & awareness; assessment & referrals; counseling & mediation); Social Care Services (home, community, institutional); Specialized Preventative Services

Integrated Approaches:
e.g., Population groups with multiple constraints

Integrated Approaches for Programs:
e.g., Programs with multiple eligibility criteria; multiple programs using common delivery platforms
Chapter 1: Outreach

Assess Potential Demand

Outreach
Intake & Registration
Assess Needs & Conditions
Outreach is crucial for promoting inclusion, awareness, and understanding

- **Direct Outreach**
  - Outreach officers
  - On-demand
  - Mobile teams

- **Community-Based Outreach**
  - Peer-to-peer outreach and mentoring
  - Rely on local capacities for disseminating info, connecting people

- **Outreach via Intermediaries**
  - Personal referrals from other professionals or programs
  - Disseminate info via other services (schools, clinics, etc.)
  - Info via other organizations – e.g., foundations, employer or trade organizations, community organizations

- **Indirect Outreach**
  - Printed media
  - Mass media
  - Online, websites

**Avoid Access Barriers:**

1. Accessibility
2. Inclusivity
3. Awareness
4. Understanding
Brazil’s Busca Activa – Example of Proactive Outreach Strategy

• Concerns about missing extremely poor HHs: indigenous groups, disabled, those living in remote areas, homeless / street populations, etc.

• Active search process included door-to-door visits by social workers, mobile social assistance vans and boats, partnerships with local governments and civil society organizations to promote referrals

• Result was registering additional 1+ million families that had previously been excluded – thereby facilitating their access to numerous social programs including Bolsa Familia
Community-Based Outreach in Pakistan’s BISP

• Communications Assessment: Media Habits of Target Population
  • 96% illiterate
  • Primarily word of mouth; >50% had phone
  • Not much use of radio or recall of communications materials

• Community-Based Communication Strategy:
  • Participatory, informal communications channels
  • Local leadership & BISP Committees
  • Mother leaders from each community serving on union councils
Chapter 4: Registering & Assessing Intended Population
2 Distinct Operating Models with Implications all Along the Delivery Chain

On-Demand Approach

- Own initiative
- At any time (own timing)

Programs & Groups:
Used with all types of SP Programs & Intended Populations (Target Groups)

Circumstances & Shocks:
Can be used for both Covariate Shocks & Idiosyncratic shocks or changes in conditions of specific HHs/individuals

Administrative Aspects:
- Requires permanent and extensive network for client interface (physical, mobile, or digital) - challenging
- Requires continuous administrative budget + flexibility in design & implementation

Administrator-Driven Approach

Programs & Groups:
Primarily used for programs targeted to households according to Socio-Economic Status (and often with relative rankings)

Circumstances & Shocks:
- Can be used for Covariate Shocks (and could do additional data collection and/or more frequent updates in shock-prone areas)
- But not compatible as a response-mechanism for idiosyncratic shocks (or changes in HH conditions)

Administrative Aspects:
- Can be useful in countries with low administrative capacity or confidence, difficult outreach, asymmetric information
- Temporarily requires large numbers of mobile teams, vehicles, other inputs for mass registration waves
- Requires large & lumpy administrative budget for registration waves
Many countries use Integrated Social Registries as a common registration & eligibility “gateway” for numerous social programs.

See our recent social registries study: Leite et. al. (2017).
Integrated Social Registries can serve as Integrated Platforms for Social Protection & Beyond

See our recent social registries study: Leite et. al. (2017).
Chapter 5: Who gets in & Who gets what?
Tensions between inclusion goals & limited budget constraints

1. Outreach
2. Intake & Registration
3. Assessment of Needs & Conditions
4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
5. Decide on B/S Package; Notification & On-boarding
6. Enrolled Beneficiaries

Intended Population
- Registrants
- Registered population that is assessed for needs & conditions

Assessment of Needs & Conditions
- Tools and algorithms for profiling classifications

Eligible Population
- Enrolled Eligible Applicants (in)
- Non-enrolled Eligible Applicants (waitlist)

Non-Eligible Applicants (out)
- Profiles from assessment + Program eligibility criteria + Other factors for prioritizing enrollment (e.g., program capacity, budget space, first-come-first served, rationing, etc.)

Some people may be referred to other programs

Content of information + info from interoperability, CBT methods; + Issue of registration targets/quotas
Absolute & Relative Thresholds for Eligibility

**Absolute Thresholds**
- Axis = Welfare Measure ($ or score)
- HH1: 100
- HH2: 160
- HH3: 90

**Relative Thresholds**
- Region 1
  - HH3: 160
  - HH4: 90
  - HH5: 90
  - HH6: 160
- Region 2
  - HH4: 160
  - HH5: 90

**Axis**
- Ranking of households from poorest to richest for each region

**Zero income**
- HH1: 100
- HH2: 90
- HH3: 90
- HH4: 100
- HH5: 90
- HH6: 90

**Zero income (situation worsens)**
- HH1
- HH2
- HH3
- HH6

**Not registered in initial wave**
- HH4

**Richest Household Region 1**
- HH4

**Poorest Household Region 2**
- HH6

**Axis**
- Welfare Measure ($ or score)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefit Structure</th>
<th>INFORMATION FOR BENEFITS CALCULATIONS</th>
<th>NOTIFICATION &amp; BENEFICIARY UNDERSTANDING</th>
<th>PAYMENTS PROCESSING, DENOMINATION ISSUE</th>
<th>MONITORING, UPDATES, GRM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Flat Benefits</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 (especially if even denomination)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Variable by HH Size, CompositoIn</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Variable by Socio-Economic Group</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Variable Benefits Differentiated by Income Level (e.g., GMI)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Variable Benefits by Earnings &amp; Contribution History (UI, DI)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Variable Benefits by Degree of Disability</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.3—Implementation Considerations of Various Benefit Structures (See Appendix 5.1 for Examples)
Activation Benefit-Service Packages for the Unemployed

1. Intake & Registration
2. Assessment of Needs & Conditions (Labor Profiling + Caseworker Assessment)
3. High
4. Determine Eligibility
   - Far from LM + Complex Risks
5. Assign Benefit & Service Packages
   - Goals: Improve Employability / Address Complex Risks
     - Intensive Counseling/IAP
     - Social Assistance Benefit
     - ALMPs to enhance employability
     - Referrals to social services
   - Goals: Improve Employability
     - Counseling/IAP
     - UI/UA Benefit
     - ALMPs to enhance employability
     - Some Employment Services
   - Goals: Connect with Jobs
     - Possible IAP
     - short-term UI/UA Benefits
     - Employment Services, such as job search assistance, career counseling

Then Provision of B&S, Monitoring of IAPs
Chapter 6: Provision of Benefits (Payments)
Payments implementation involves two main processes: administration & provision

Chapter builds on: Payments Inventory (forthcoming), G2P 3.0 (CGAP), Previous CGAP inventories, in-country SPJ work
How are Payments Implemented? Composite Example – with Digital EBCs & Manual Payments

Central Level (MoSA, Payment Info System)
- Generate Payroll (HH designated recipient IDs, amounts, payment methods)
- Approve Payroll (final closing)
- Send payment instruction to Treasury & Send payroll order to PSP

National Treasury
- Reviews payments instruction and schedules transfer of funds to MoSA Account
- Check are printed, sorted and sealed according to post office batches

Payment Service Provider (PSP)
- PSP receives payroll order with details from MoSA
- PSP transfers to each Benefit Card accordingly
- Checks are printed, sorted, sealed and sent in batches to each local PSP Agency
- Local PSP Agency receives, verifies and records batch of checks with payroll instructions
- Local PSP Agency announces payments schedule and locations

Beneficiaries
- Beneficiaries Cash Out With EBC with card & PIN
- Beneficiaries pick up checks at local PSP agency or distribution point, with ID Authentication

Funds Flows
- PSP receives funds and payments order from Treasury
- Local PSP Agency receives, verifies and records batch of checks with payroll instructions
- Local PSP Agency announces payments schedule and locations
- Beneficiaries pick up checks at local PSP agency or distribution point, with ID Authentication
Payments administration

Multi-actor/ Multi-sector agenda

- Establishment of payroll: Interoperability of BOMS & Social Registry and ID system(s)
- Payments management: Interactions with MOF (Treasury) and Payment Service Provider(s) (PSP) for the delivery of funds
- Reconciliation of payments: Confirmation of who and when received the benefits

Process (administration) maps for: Nigeria, Ghana, Indonesia, Turkey, Pakistan, Bangladesh

Technology support payments admin: from excel list (Ghana), to payments module in BOMS (Turkey), payment ‘gateways’ to provide interoperability with PSP (Zambia) or even block chain (Australia)
Rapid evolution in payments delivery mainly linked to technological development and financial sector regulatory changes.

**Payments Service Provision**

- Office
- Payment Camp
- ATM
- Bank branch
- Home delivery
- Local Bank Agent
- Store

**Evolution of Safety Net Payment in Bangladesh**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>1.0 Payments not from FI</th>
<th>2.0 Payments from State owned FI</th>
<th>3.0 Payments from state owned FI + Private FI</th>
<th>3.5 Payments from state owned FI + Private FI</th>
<th>4.0 Payments from any FI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>Unsecured</td>
<td>Semi secure</td>
<td>Secure</td>
<td>Fully secure</td>
<td>Fully secure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility</td>
<td>PSP based</td>
<td>PSP based</td>
<td>PSP based</td>
<td>Customer centric</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Aziz, Cho, Nishikawa Chavez, 2018

- Actors/PSP (and inst. arrangements)
- Methods (manual vs. electronic)
- Instruments (cash, voucher, cards, e-wallets, biometric)
- Frequency
- Indicative Costs
- Innovations (including behavioral nudges)
Some countries pay SA benefits in digitally, many still manually. Frequency of payments varies.
Chapter 7: Provision of Social & Labor Services
## Typologies of Social Services by Risk Groups
(Children, Youth, Adults, Disabled, Elderly, etc.)

**Table 7.2 - Typology of Social Services: Examples for Children (Ages 0-18)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk group</th>
<th>Social Work Services</th>
<th>Care Services (Direct Provision)</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Information, Awareness</td>
<td>Intermediation, Referrals</td>
<td>Counseling, Mediation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children facing potential delays in development or disabilities</td>
<td>Parenting &amp; ECD Classes, Support Groups, Special instruction</td>
<td>Specialized assessments (learning, psycho-social, occupational, physical)</td>
<td>Counseling for behavioral needs, Family Counseling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children at risk of neglect, Abandon-ment abuse</td>
<td>Child abuse Hotline, Child abuse prevention, awareness</td>
<td>Child abuse screening, risk assessments, Service referrals</td>
<td>Child -Family counseling, Mediation, Reunification planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


ECD = Early Childhood Development; EI = Early Intervention; IEP = Individualized Education Plan; OT = Occupational Therapy, PT = Physical Therapy, SLT = Speech-Language Therapy
Delivery Chain for Social Services for Children @ Risk of Developmental Delays or Disabilities (Composite Example)

**Outreach, Intake, Registration, Assessment**

- **Self-Initiated** (parents walk-in)
- **Referral** from other agency, program, professional
- **Intake, Registration, Initial Assessment**

**Child Evaluation and Assessments**

- Assessments may be carried out by specialized professionals, with referrals from the caseworker

**Eligible for supports?**

- **Yes**
  - **Establish IAP with service referrals** (with parents)
  - **Establish IAP** with service referrals

- **No**
  - **Refer**
  - **Other community resources, health, education Services**

**Enrollment**

**Establish IAP with service referrals** (with parents)

**Provision**

- **Social Work Services** (counseling, parent & family education, awareness)
  - **Public Provision** (SS Agency)
  - **Vendor or Voucher**
- **Home-Based Care Services & Equipment**
  - **Community-Care Services**
  - **Monitoring & Management**
    - Including: regular check ins on child's progress & IAP, monitoring service providers, etc.
- **M&M**
### Table 7.6 – Taxonomy of Labor Services for the Short-Term and Long-Term Unemployed by Type of Service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Group</th>
<th>Benefits (Passive or Active)</th>
<th>Employment Services: helping people find jobs</th>
<th>Employability-Enhancing Services / ALMPs: helping people become more employable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Short-Term Unemployed (similar for youth/first-time job seekers)</td>
<td>• ST benefits (UI or UA), usually with IAPs &amp; co-responsibilities&lt;br&gt;• Back-to-work incentives&lt;br&gt;• Start-up support for businesses, entrepreneurship</td>
<td>• Self-service tools&lt;br&gt;• Job matching platforms&lt;br&gt;• Websites and call centers</td>
<td>• Training to refresh or upgrade skills&lt;br&gt;• Entrepreneurship training&lt;br&gt;• Apprenticeships&lt;br&gt;• Wage subsidies for firms to hire unemployed or first-time job seekers&lt;br&gt;• Subsidies for firms to adjust working place or to purchase assistive technology for employees with disabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-Term Unemployed (LTU)</td>
<td>• LT benefits (UA or SA after UI runs out), usually with IAPs &amp; co-responsibilities</td>
<td>• Self-service tools &amp; job matching platforms&lt;br&gt;• Outreach activities for youth, discouraged, inactive workers</td>
<td>• Job-readiness and soft-skills training&lt;br&gt;• Occupational / technical skills training&lt;br&gt;• Basic &amp; second-chance education&lt;br&gt;• Digital literacy&lt;br&gt;• Wage subsidies for firms to hire LTU&lt;br&gt;• Public works/job creation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ compilation based on: Kuddo (May 2012); Loxha and Morgandi (August 2014); Brown and Koettl (2015).

ST = Short Term; UI = Unemployment Insurance; UA = Unemployment Assistance; IAP = Individualized Action Plans; LT = Long Term; SA = Social Assistance; LTU = Long Term Unemployed.
Composite Example: Labor Services for Youth-at-Risk (NEET)
### Table 7.7 - Examples of quality standards for specific social services targeted at demographic groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic group</th>
<th>Specific service and criteria for quality standards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Early childhood development, education and care services (ECEC):** | - Accessible, available and affordable to families and children, encouraging participation, diversity and social inclusion  
- Well qualified staff with continuous training and supportive working conditions that facilitate observation, reflection, innovation, planning and teamwork with parents  
- Curriculum based on pedagogical goals and values, combining education and care for holistic development, to ensure children’s full potential and joint engagement of staff, children and parents  
- M&E processes to support continuous improvements on the best interest of the child  
- Strong governance with clear roles and responsibilities for all stakeholders                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| **Services for youth at risk:**                        | - Young people are included in design, implementation and evaluation to ensure responsiveness to their needs  
- Service complies with legislation applicable to children and young people, includes health and safety procedures and provides supportive environment  
- Contain a range of effective youth work methodologies, helping to develop technical, personal and social skills  
- Practice of innovation and critical reflection                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| **Home, community and Institutional care for the elderly:** | - Free choice of provider  
- Staff’s qualification for personalized care  
- Low levels of bureaucracy  
- Structural quality including physical environment and exploitation of technologies  
- Federal funding at least assures minimum standards for quality of elderly care                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |

## Modalities for Integrated Service Delivery (Labor and/or Social Services)

### Table 7.9 – Instruments for integrated provision of services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Information and Orientation</th>
<th>Levels of integration</th>
<th>Case Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems</strong></td>
<td>Service Mapping with additional information for managing and improving the system (number and types of requests, etc.)</td>
<td>Contains specific information about the client. Ideally this system would automatically calculate the eligibility for each individual/family. It also serves for the referrals.</td>
<td>More sophisticated system that supports assessment (information gathering and eligibility calculation), planning (preparing the joint plan), and monitoring the joint plan. Serves the referrals and counter-referrals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Mapping</strong></td>
<td>Contains information on generic characteristics such as location, schedule, main eligibility criteria, type of support, etc.</td>
<td>Must contain detailed information on the eligibility criteria, and the specific schedule or timing for receiving new beneficiaries</td>
<td>Similar details as for intermediation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Referral and Counter-referral mechanisms</strong></td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>Simple service protocols, often just general agreements to collaborate</td>
<td>More detailed service protocols specifically containing how the referral and counter-referrals would be done, and the joint monitoring of the case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Single Case File</strong></td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>File including simple information, from a short screening, generally not sent to other programs</td>
<td>More detailed file, containing information from assessment, joint plan and activities, and monitoring of progress informed by the services themselves (and not the clients)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 8: How to Monitor & Manage Beneficiaries?
Beneficiary Monitoring and Management Framework

Main BMM Functions and other information streams (inputs)

- Basic Beneficiary Management
- Conditionalities Monitoring
- GRM

Updated Beneficiary Information (output)

- Updated Beneficiary Registry
- Updated Benefit/Service Package
- Grievance process updated
- Updated delivery logistics
- Required field actions

Information processing & decisions

- Information is validated, processed and recorded
- Decisions are made

From Provision Stage (recurrent cycle)

- Reconciliation

From Enrollment Stage

- New beneficiaries

To Provide Stage
Basic Beneficiary Management Framework

**Source of Update**

**Beneficiary Triggered**
- Updating rules / protocols
  - Updating periods
  - Update requirements
  - Validation
  - Authorization / approval

**Program Triggered**
- Fieldwork-based
- Database Interlink-based

**Updating Process**

**Outputs**

- Update the beneficiary registry (including exiting beneficiaries)
- Update the benefit or Service package.
- Update delivery logistics.
- Basic information corrected
How do CCTs Monitor Conditionalities? How Long Does it take? Three factors come into play....

- Compliance Monitoring Period for each Implementation Cycle
- Compliance Verification Processing (U Shape Process)
- Consequences for Non-Compliance: Policy Stance + Processing
How is Compliance Verified? Typical “U-shape” process (simplified Philippines 4Ps Example for Education)

Central Level
- Generate Beneficiary List & Compliance Verification Forms (CVFs)

Regional/Provincial Level
- Print & Distribute CVFs
- Collect CVFs from facilities, check for completeness, transmit to regional level
- Collect CVFs, enter data into compliance verification information system (CV-IS)
- Recommend compliance decisions, record in CV-IS
- Approve & record compliance decisions in the CV-IS

Local: City/Municipal Links (C/ML)
- Distribute CVFs to schools (Health facilities)
- School officials record school attendance on CVFs
- Collect CVFs, enter data into compliance verification information system (CV-IS)
- Recommend compliance decisions, record in CV-IS
- Approve & record compliance decisions in the CV-IS

School / Dept of Education (same for health under DoH)
- Submit compliance info to Payroll Department for updating of beneficiary status and benefits calculation

Dashed lines = paper-based process; Solid lines = information system
**Linking Conditionalities to Payments In the Master Schedule**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Turkey CCT - Education &amp; Health</th>
<th>Month 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compliance Period</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CP1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance Verification Period &amp; Link to Payroll</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Continue next cycle...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payments Frequency</td>
<td>Bi-Monthly</td>
<td>Bi-Monthly</td>
<td>Bi-Monthly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Turkey’s CCT:**
All payments directly linked to compliance information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brazil Bolsa Familia: Monthly payments (12 times per year) with....</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brazil BFP - Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance Period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance Verification Period &amp; Link to Payroll</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payments Frequency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Brazil Bolsa Familia:**
Monthly payments (12 times per year) with....

- Links to compliance with **education** conditionalities four times per year...
- Links to compliance with **health** conditionalities Twice a year...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brazil BFP - Health</th>
<th>Month 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compliance Period</td>
<td>CP1 (Six months compliance period)</td>
<td>Continue next cycle...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance Verification Period &amp; Link to Payroll</td>
<td></td>
<td>CVP1 (actual time is less, but 2 months allotted)</td>
<td>Compliance linked to Payroll</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Compliance Rates vs. Monitoring Rates

Compliance Rates: Education Conditionalities
(Latest data available: 2017-18)

- Indonesia PKH, Ages 6-18: 100%
- Mexico Prospera, Ages 6-18: 99%
- Colombia MFA, Ages 5-18: 96%
- Brazil BFP, Ages 6-17: 94%
- Tanzania PSSN, Ages 5-18: 94%
- Pakistan WeT CCT, Ages 4-12: 93%
- Philippines 4Ps, Ages 3-8: 91%
- Jamaica PATH, Girls, Ages 6-18: 85%
- Jamaica PATH, Boys, Ages 6-18: 80%
- Unweighted Average: 92%

Monitoring Rates: Education Conditionalities
(Latest data available: 2017-18)

- Turkey CCT, Ages 6-25: 100%
- Colombia MFA, Ages 5-18: 100%
- Mexico Prospera, Ages 6-18: 99%
- Tanzania PSSN, Ages 5-18: 94%
- Pakistan WeT CCT, Ages 4-12: 93%
- Brazil BFP, Ages 6-17: 88%
- Philippines 4Ps, Ages 3-8: 84%
- Jamaica PATH, Boys & Girls Ages 6-18: 83%
- Indonesia PKH, Ages 6-18: 83%
- Unweighted Average: 87%

Compliance Rates: Health Conditionalities
(Latest data available: 2017-18)

- Mexico Prospera, Women and Children: 99%
- Brazil BFP, Women 14-44, & Children < 7: 98%
- Tanzania PSSN, Children: 91%
- Philippines 4Ps, Women PKH, and Children: 90%
- Indonesia PSSN, Women and Children: 84%
- Colombia MFA, Families: 70%
- Jamaica PATH, Women & Children: 70%
- Unweighted Average: 90%

Monitoring Rates: Health Conditionalities
(Latest data available: 2017-18)

- Turkey CCT, Women and Children: 100%
- Jamaica PATH, Women and Children: 100%
- Colombia MFA, Women and Children: 93%
- Tanzania PSSN, Children: 97%
- Brazil BFP, Women 14-44 & children < 7: 77%
- Indonesia PKH, P/L Women: 33%
- Unweighted Average: 84%
Grievances, Complaints, Appeals Along the Delivery Chain: Examples

OUTREACH:
“We weren’t informed” (people excluded from or missed by outreach efforts);
“That’s what they told us” (misinformation, miscommunication)

INTAKE & REGISTRATION:
“The information on my income is incorrect.” (information error?)
“We weren’t given a chance to register” (exclusion)
“We weren’t told what documents to bring.” (process)
“We had to wait many hours and come back many times” (TCV)
“La entrevistadora no hablaba inglés” (lack of language translation for intake)

ASSESSMENT:
“My neighbor has a car and was admitted to the program, but my situation is worse and I was excluded” (inclusion & exclusion errors?)
“I never heard back from the program about my application” (failure to notify)
“My cousin’s family was awarded $120 per month, but we only get $90” (benefit errors?)
“My pension was miscalculated due to errors in my contributions data” (social insurance complaint on benefit amounts)
“They have no jobs for me” (lack of job placement services)
“The caseworker put me in a job that I am over-qualified for” (mismatched employment)
“The day care center that they placed us with is dirty and the staff ignore the kids” (quality service standards)

ELIGIBILITY, B&S PACKAGE
“My account was not credited this month” (missing or delayed payment)
“This month’s payment was less than last month” (payment error?)
“We have to walk 6 hours to get to the payment point, the post used to bring it to us directly.” (payment service complaints)

PAYMENT OF BENEFITS
“My address is incorrect in the system so I missed the notification.” (data correction)
“I filed a complaint 6 months ago and never heard back.” (complaints about GRM)
“My kid was in school the whole month, why did they reduce our benefits for absences?” (complaint on conditionalities compliance and consequences)
“I have to go the PES and CSW every three months to show that I’m looking for a job – I can’t afford to take that many buses” (TCV, processes)
“My benefits were wrongly terminated.” (appeal of exit decision)

PROVISION OF SERVICES
“They have no jobs for me” (lack of job placement services)
“The caseworker put me in a job that I am over-qualified for” (mismatched employment)
“The day care center that they placed us with is dirty and the staff ignore the kids” (quality service standards)

OVERSEE:
“My address is incorrect in the system so I missed the notification.” (data correction)
“I filed a complaint 6 months ago and never heard back.” (complaints about GRM)
“My kid was in school the whole month, why did they reduce our benefits for absences?” (complaint on conditionalities compliance and consequences)
“I have to go the PES and CSW every three months to show that I’m looking for a job – I can’t afford to take that many buses” (TCV, processes)
“My benefits were wrongly terminated.” (appeal of exit decision)
Rwand’s Vision 2020 Umurenge Program (VUP): Summary Process Map for GRM System

1. Beneficiary or non-beneficiary communicates complaint or appeal informally.
2. Beneficiary or non-beneficiary receives response.
3. Beneficiary or non-beneficiary files a complaint or appeal.
4. Records on VUP Appeals & Complaints Form in register & in Ikayi y’ Ibibazo.
5. Provides written response to appellant / complainant in Ikayi y’ Ibibazo.
7. Issues preventive measures (if any).
8. Produces Quarterly Reports on all appeals and complaints.
9. Reviews complaint & resolves or refers to sector council.
10. Reviews complaint & resolves or refers to district council.
11. Reviews complaint & provides resolution.
12. Reviews complaint & resolves or refers to ombudsman.
13. Reviews complaint & resolves or refers to sector council.

Notes:
- VUP PMU
- Ombudsman
- District Council
- Sector Council
- Village & Cell General Assembly
- Call / Sector / Up to Sector / District Staff
- Beneficiary or Citizen
Chapter 9: Performance of Delivery Systems
Common lack of attention to role of delivery in M&E Frameworks

Impacts
- Reduced poverty, inequality, vulnerability and malnutrition

Outcomes
- Productive inclusion of poor and vulnerable beneficiaries
- Enhanced resilience of beneficiaries to moderate shocks

Intermediate outcomes
- Increased livelihood diversification
- Increased consumption
- Increased social inclusion

Outputs
- Increased income
- Strengthened linkages and referral of beneficiaries to complementary benefits and services
- Increased access to financial and income generating activities and skills building

Activities (Programs)
- Categorical Programs for Demographic Groups
- Programs for Poor / Low-income Groups
- Benefits & Services for Persons with Disabilities
- Labor Benefits/Services
- Social Services for Individuals/Families
- Integrated approaches for benefits & services

Performance of delivery systems
Programs deliver services and benefits effectively and efficiently and promote the inclusion of specific groups with access barriers.

**Outreach:**
- Intended Population (IP), including Vulnerable Groups (VG) understands program & willing to apply

**Intake & Registration:**
- IP and VG are applying efficiently and their information is recorded accurately

**Assess needs & conditions:**
- Applicants are accurately profiled and categorized

**Enrollment:**
- Eligible applicants are onboarded efficiently, with minimal leakage to ineligible population

**Decision on package:**
- Benefits and service packages are accurately determined

**Benefits & Services:**
- Enrolled beneficiaries receive appropriate services and benefits according to service standards

**Beneficiary monitoring:**
- Information is kept up to date, free of EFC, responsive to citizens evolving needs, & promote desired behaviors

---

**Information systems are robust** (with complete, accurate, unique information); **secure** (protect data privacy and ensures transaction safety); **efficient** (minimizes time and money involved in providing, curating, and accessing information); **interoperable and dynamic**

**Communications and Client Interface** provide appropriate information and support to citizens, especially those with access barriers, to guide them through the process in a user-centered way

**Institutions are well-governed** (with robust legal framework, clear roles and responsibilities, appropriate oversight); **well-resourced** (with skilled human resources and appropriate budgets and incentives); and **well-coordinated**
Delivery Systems Performance Indicators: Examples

**Assess**

1. **Potential Demand**
   - % of population that is registered
     - **Data source:** Numerator: Registry data; Denominator: census data
   - % of intended population that is registered (or of vulnerable groups)
     - **Data source:** Numerator: Registry data with indicators of characteristics of intended population; Denominator: Administrative, Census, HH survey data
   - % of registered population with up-to-date basic information (e.g., < 2 years old)
     - **Data source:** Numerator: Registry data or Periodic audit data; Denominator: Registry data

2. **Intake & Registration**
3. **Assess Needs & Conditions**

**Enroll**

4. **Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions**
5. **Determine Benefits & Service Package**
6. **Notification & Onboarding**

**Provide**

7. **Benefits and/or Services**
   - Processing times: # of days to process benefit payments; or % of beneficiaries receiving payment for each cycle according to quality standards (e.g., < 30 days)
     - **Data source:** Payment system data

**Monitor & Manage**

8. **Beneficiaries**
9. **Grievances**
   - % of beneficiaries with updated information
     - **Data source:** Administrative info
   - % of sampled (or cross-checked) beneficiaries without information errors
     - **Data source:** Periodic audits or cross-check
   - % of registered grievances resolved
     - **Data source:** GRM data
   - % of individual beneficiaries in each category with conditionalities monitoring information
     - **Data source:** Administrative data
   - % of service clients with IAPs that are monitored according to quality standards
     - **Data source:** Administrative data

**Recurring Cycle**

- # of days from application to eligibility notification; # of applications processed according to quality standards (e.g., < 30 days)
- % of unemployed clients who move into employment within specific time band
- % of service clients with Individualized Action Plans (IAPs)
- % of service clients with IAPs that are monitored according to quality standards
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Process Evaluation</td>
<td>• Objectives: Focus on implementation processes to identify what works, what doesn't and why, and how to remedy issues</td>
<td>• Approach: A range of evaluation methods (quantitative and qualitative) can be leveraged, including user satisfaction or beneficiary feedback surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Process Reviews</td>
<td>• Objectives: Assess the effectiveness of specific business processes or procedures, typically communication, intake and registration, payment provision, grievance handling</td>
<td>• Approach: Process mapping, process definition chart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance audits/checks</td>
<td>• Objectives: Determine whether the rules and procedures are being undertaken in accordance with the requirements of the program and standards operating procedures</td>
<td>• Approach: Spot checks, sample recheck, to validate the accuracy of the information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency Analysis</td>
<td>• Objectives: Compare costs of alternative systems or processes, and relate costs to outcomes</td>
<td>• Approach: Setting out a baseline scenario against which the incremental costs and benefits will be measured, monetizing costs, produce a cost effectiveness ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Systems Reviews</td>
<td>• Objectives: Determine whether the information systems, related resources and their environment are appropriate (safeguard assets, maintain data integrity, provide reliable information and consume resource efficiently)</td>
<td>• Approach: Review of data management procedures, data entry, data quality verifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Reviews</td>
<td>• Objectives: Diagnostic of the institutional and operational structure of the agency or program to establish whether management system, policies, staffing, organizational structure are appropriate</td>
<td>• Approach: A range of methods, including staff survey, benchmarking, institutional mapping</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Selected Trends in Delivery System Developments

- Surge in digital technologies applied to service delivery
  - Digital payments
  - Cloud technologies
  - Process automation and AI
  - Big data analytics

➤ Every problem is a nail to the person with a hammer (!) Assess need and use for technology; Pay attention to data protection and privacy

- Many countries are developing integrated services/benefits delivery approaches. Includes an emphasis on Social Registry/Beneficiary Registry with dynamic inclusion as common gateways for multiple programs (Chile, Brazil, Turkey, Georgia, etc.)

➤ Integration of services may be the wave of the future (employment and social services, emergency assistance and housing)
Increasing attention among some governments and institutions to “human-centered design” considerations for delivery systems. Technology is only useful if people can use it (beneficiaries as well as administrators). Leads to a concern over institutional capability for delivery.

- Institutions matter, along with budgets, processes and skilled human resources
Key Messages from the Sourcebook

- Delivery systems evolve over time. Starting points matter (path dependency)
- Keep it simple, do it well (!)
- The weakest link affects the whole system (interconnectedness)
- First mile of client interface matters (often neglected)
- Avoid developing delivery systems in isolation (whole-of-government approach)
- Delivery systems in social protection can enable interventions in other sectors (e.g. health insurance, scholarships, housing, human capital interventions)
- There is no single blueprint for delivery systems, but there are commonalities and context-based good practices.
# Social Safety Nets and Delivery Core Course  Week 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preston Auditorium</td>
<td>Room J 01-080</td>
<td>Room J 01-080</td>
<td>Room J 01-080</td>
<td>Room J 01-080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8:00 - 8:45 am</strong></td>
<td>Welcome breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8:45 - 9:30 am</strong></td>
<td>Welcome and daily overview Margaret Gross</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
<td>Sign-up/Instruction for group work Julieta Trías, Adea Kryszu</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>THEMES</strong></td>
<td><strong>Overview</strong></td>
<td><strong>Delivery (I)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Delivery (II)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Safety nets and jobs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9:00-10:30 am</strong></td>
<td><strong>Session 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lecture</strong></td>
<td>Communication and outreach in social safety nets Surat Nisour</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Session 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>Day 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lecture</strong></td>
<td>Social safety nets: a primer and overview Ugo Gentili</td>
<td>Safety nets and economic inclusion Colin Andrews, Syed Hashemi, Edmundo Murguía</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>10:30 - 11:00 am</strong></td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>11:00-12:30 pm</strong></td>
<td><strong>Session 2</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lecture</strong></td>
<td>Delivering safety nets: a framework John Blomquist</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Session 2</strong></td>
<td><strong>Day 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lecture</strong></td>
<td>Institutions and coordination Tina George</td>
<td>Connecting transfers and activation Matteo Mongiardelli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>12:30 – 2:00 pm</strong></td>
<td>Lunch break</td>
<td>Lunch with Practice Managers</td>
<td>Lunch session Payments mechanisms, experiences and tools Silvia Boru-Yazbeck, Ioana Butea, John Giachino, Ana Vizzicosa Lopez, Anri Moubarak, Nilima Ramteke, Luz Rodriguez</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2:00-3:30 pm</strong></td>
<td><strong>Session 3</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lecture</strong></td>
<td>Choices in cash transfers: key design parameters Margaret Gross</td>
<td>Lecture Monitoring safety nets implementation John Blomquist, Ines Rodriguez Coiolaiura</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Session 3</strong></td>
<td><strong>Day 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lecture</strong></td>
<td>Targeting: concepts and practice Philippe Leite</td>
<td>Panel Public works as safety nets Enderhow Tokease, Sarah Coll-Black, Paul Dancer, and Arthur Alkip-Lagrange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3:30 – 4:00 pm</strong></td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4:00 – 5:30 pm</strong></td>
<td><strong>Session 4</strong></td>
<td><strong>Panel</strong> The economics and politics of safety nets: how to “make the case” Aline Courouleau, Benedicte de la Briere, Ekhwar Malik, Manuel Salazar</td>
<td>Interactive Group work Adea Kryszu</td>
<td>Lecture Social pensions: issues and perspectives Robert Paolos and Margaret Gross</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group Photo and Reception</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Social Safety Nets and Delivery Core Course  Week 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Day 6 – Monday, Nov 4</th>
<th>Day 7 – Tuesday, Nov 5</th>
<th>Day 8 – Wednesday, Nov 6</th>
<th>Day 9 – Thursday, Nov 7</th>
<th>Day 10 – Friday, Nov 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:15 – 8:45 am</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
<td>Light breakfast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:45 – 9:00 am</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
<td>Daily overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>THEMES</strong></td>
<td><strong>Safety nets and human capital</strong></td>
<td><strong>Safety nets, crises and adaptation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Financing and financing</strong></td>
<td><strong>Group presentations</strong></td>
<td><strong>Feedback and closing</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00 – 10:30 am</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Participants’ presentations and discussion</td>
<td>Reflections on key emerging issues and learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 1</td>
<td>Safety nets, human capital and early years investments Laura Rawlings, Julietta Trias</td>
<td>Resilience, adaptive social protection and humanitarian assistance Julie Darra, Thomas Bowen, Vaughan, Patrick Premand, Asha Williams, Sarah Goff Block</td>
<td>Financing social protection: issues and practices Alexander Pick</td>
<td></td>
<td>Facilitated discussion Ugo Gentilini, John DiMona, course participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 – 11:00 am</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break (course evaluation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 – 12:30 pm</td>
<td>Panel</td>
<td>Panel</td>
<td>Interactive</td>
<td>Participants’ presentations and discussion</td>
<td>‘Bringing it all together’: a system view Anush Bezhanyan, Margaret Grosh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 2</td>
<td>Gender, violence and safety nets: cross-country evidence and practices Matthias Lundberg, Alke Coudreau, Diana Jimena Arrugo, Alessandra Heinemann</td>
<td>Safety nets in conflict and displacement settings Rebekka Grun, Afrah Alawi Al-Ahmad, Miirey Qawadha</td>
<td>Evaluating safety nets Patrick Premand</td>
<td></td>
<td>Official closing and certificate distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30 – 2:00 pm</td>
<td>Lunch session</td>
<td>Lunch break or interactive</td>
<td>Lunch with Practice Managers or group work</td>
<td>Field trip</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food-based safety nets: programs and evolution Harold Alderman</td>
<td>(box lunch) DC DHS visit of US safety nets Implementation Iyes Rodriguez Corllova</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 – 5:30 pm</td>
<td>Panel</td>
<td>Panel</td>
<td>Interactive</td>
<td>Participants’ presentations and discussion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Session 3</td>
<td>Behavioral approaches to enhance cash transfers Laura Rawlings, Andrea Vermehren, Saugato Datta and Josh Martín</td>
<td>Adapting safety nets to urban areas Ugo Gentilini, Ellen Hamilton, Judy Baker, Andrea Vermehren</td>
<td>Economic crises and energy subsidy reforms Anir Mosabary, Adee Kryezlu</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:30 – 4:00 pm</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
<td>Coffee/tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00 – 5:30 pm</td>
<td>Interactive</td>
<td>Interactive</td>
<td>Interactive</td>
<td>Participants’ presentations and discussion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank You!