AZERBAIJAN SABER EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT (ECD) COUNTRY REPORT 2018

Preliminary Findings of the ECD Policy Analysis and Recommendations

Azerbaijan Human Capital Forum
December 19-21, 2018
Why is ECD a Priority for Investment?

- Investments in ECD can address early gaps in opportunity.
- Investments in ECD yield long-lasting high returns.
- Investments in ECD can maximize both efficiency and equity.
- ECD investments can help achieve a range of policy objectives.
Context- SABER- ECD
SABER-ECD: Analytical framework

3 policy goals and 3 policy levers:

**Policy Goals**
- Establishing an Enabling Environment
- Implementing Widely
- Monitoring and Assuring Quality

**Policy Levers**
- Legal Framework
- Intersectoral Coordination
- Finance
- Scope of Programs
- Coverage
- Equity
- Data Availability
- Quality Standards
- Compliance with Standards

**Outcome**
All children have the opportunity to reach their full potential

WORLD BANK GROUP
Education
SABER-ECD: Data Collection Tool

- Includes approximately 130 questions
- Covers sectorial policies in **education**, **health**, **nutrition** and **social and child protection**

**ECD policies**

**Education**

**Health**

**Social and child protection**

**Nutrition**

- **General ECD Policy Information**
  - Multi-sectorial policies
  - Institutional arrangements
  - Coordination mechanisms
  - Budget allocation

- **Complementary data sources used**
  - World Bank’s Women, Business and the Law database
  - UNICEF’s Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
  - UNESCO’s Institute for Statistics
  - WHO’s Global Database
  - WHO’s Global Health Expenditure Database
## Snapshot of ECD in Azerbaijan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metric</th>
<th>Azerbaijan</th>
<th>Bulgaria</th>
<th>Georgia</th>
<th>Kyrgyzstan</th>
<th>Tajikistan</th>
<th>Romania</th>
<th>Russian Federation</th>
<th>Ukraine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Under 5 mortality rate, 2015</strong></td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infant mortality rate (under 1), 2015</strong></td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Exclusive breastfeeding &lt;6 months (%), 2010-2015</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moderate &amp; severe stunting (%), 2010-2015</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Birth registration (%), 2010-2015</strong></td>
<td>94</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Net enrollment rate (3-6-year-olds), 2014</strong></td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>82.9</td>
<td>38.7 (2006)</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>74.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Policy Goal 1 – Establishing an Enabling Environment
Policy Level 1.1: Legal Framework

Legal framework to ensure essential ECD services are in place

**Early learning**
- National laws to promote ECD

**Child and social protection**
- Employment protection and breastfeeding facilities
- Ensure ECD services to vulnerable children and children with disability

**Health**
- Guarantee healthcare services for pregnant women

**Nutrition**
- Safeguard appropriate dietary consumption and improve nutrition intake
Policy Level 1.2: Inter-sectoral Coordination
Positive Features of Inter-sectoral Coordination in Azerbaijan

Key ministries involved in ECD provision

- Ministry of Education (MoE)
- Ministry of Health (MoH)
- Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of Populations (MoLSPP)

- No regular coordination meetings between the different implementing actors at the national or sub-national levels
- No multisectoral ECD strategies
Policy Level 1.3: Finance

Government expenditure on preschool education (2015-2016, latest)

- Public expenditure on preschool as a percent-age of government expenditure on education is **10.5** percent in 2016
- The government spending on ECD is one of the lowest among peer countries

Source: UNESCO UIS, 2015-2016
Policy Goal 2 – Implementing Widely
## Policy Level 2.1: Scope of Programs (2/2)

Scope of ECD interventions in Azerbaijan by target population and sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sectors</th>
<th>Parents/ Caregivers</th>
<th>Pregnant Women</th>
<th>Children (1-3)</th>
<th>Children (3-6)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social and Child Protection</strong></td>
<td>Conditional cash transfer programs; family cash benefits; paid maternity leave; targeted social assistance for low-income families</td>
<td>Promotion of parent-child relationship for vulnerable families</td>
<td>Housing and care interventions for vulnerable children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Health</strong></td>
<td>Parenting programs; home visiting programs</td>
<td>Prenatal and skilled delivery care; mental health services</td>
<td>Compulsory immunizations; childhood wellness, growth monitoring and promotion programs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nutrition</strong></td>
<td>Breastfeeding promotion</td>
<td>Salt iodization</td>
<td>Exclusive breastfeeding under 6 months; feeding at ECEC facilities; micronutrient support; salt iodization</td>
<td>Feeding programs at preschools; micronutrient support; salt iodization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Parent engagement; family-based ECEC</td>
<td>Nursuries</td>
<td>Kindergartens; School Readiness Program (5-6-year-olds)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Level of access to essential health and nutrition services are below that of peer countries

- Only 36 percent of children with suspected pneumonia receive antibiotics
- The percentage of infants exclusively breastfeeding until 6 months of age is the lowest at 12 percent among regional peers
- Consumption of iodized salt is low at 54 percent
- The rate of moderate and severe stunting of children under 5 and the percentage of infants born with low birth weights are the highest
Azerbaijan has one of the lowest levels of ECEC coverage in ECA.
Azerbaijan's improvement in PISA reading scores if the proportion of students with more than one year of preschool education increases

- Better learning outcomes in Azerbaijan are associated with more years of preschool education
- Reaching a 100 percent preschool coverage would only increase Azerbaijan’s PISA performance by 6 points

Increasing both **access** and **quality** in preschool education is key
Policy Level 2.3: Equity

Disparities in Access to ECD services

- There are notable disparities in access to ECD services by socioeconomic status and between rural and urban areas.

**Top vs bottom socioeconomic quantiles**

- Birth registration (%)
- Skilled attendant at birth (%)
- Stunting prevalence in children under 5 (%)

**Urban vs rural**

- Birth registration (%)
- Skilled attendant at birth (%)
- Population using improved sanitation facilities (%)

Policy Goal 3—Monitoring and Assuring Quality
### Positive Features of Data Availability in Azerbaijan

#### Administrative Data:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Tracked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ECCE enrollment rates by region</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special needs children enrolled in ECCE (number of)</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children attending well-child visit (number of)</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children benefiting from public nutrition intervention (number of)</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women receiving prenatal nutrition interventions</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children enrolled in ECCE by sub-national region</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is ECCE spending in education sector differentiated within education budget?</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is ECD spending in health sector differentiated within health budget?</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Survey Data:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Tracked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population consuming iodized salt (%)</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vitamin A Supplementation rate for children 6-59 months (%)</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anemia prevalence amongst pregnant women</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children below the age of 5 registered at birth</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children immunized against DPT3 at age 12 months</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnant women who attend four antenatal visits</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children enrolled in ECCE by socioeconomic status</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Policy Level 3.2: Quality Standards

Standards to ensure quality ECD services are in place

- Clear learning standards
- Registration and accreditation mechanisms
- National standards for ECD professionals
- Infrastructure standards for ECD facilities
Policy Level 3.3: Compliance with Standards

**Standards**

- Clear learning standards
- Registration and accreditation mechanisms
- National standards for ECD professionals
- Infrastructure standards for ECD facilities

**Compliance**

- N/A
- N/A
- 91% of caregivers meet the educational requirements
- 100% of public and private kindergartens follow construction standards
## Key Policy Options and Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Establishing an Enabling Environment</th>
<th>II. Implementing Widely</th>
<th>III. Monitoring and Assuring Quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Design intersectoral ECD strategy and coordination mechanism</td>
<td>• Expand access to health and nutrition interventions to lower rate of childhood stunting and low birth weight</td>
<td>• Expand data collection to track access to and quality of ECD services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Establish budget planning system to manage investments across ECD sectors</td>
<td>• Develop strategies to improve ECD coordination efforts to accommodate children’s special needs at service delivery</td>
<td>• Improve the monitoring and evaluation system to ensure that service provision and infrastructure standards remain compliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increase public financing of early childhood education (introducing per-student formulas)</td>
<td>• Improve access to ECD services in rural and low SES areas</td>
<td>• Set mandatory training for all ECCE professionals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank you!
Annex
## Policy Level 1.3: Finance

### Regional Comparison of select expenditure indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Azerbaijan</th>
<th>Georgia</th>
<th>Kyrgyzstan</th>
<th>Russian Federation</th>
<th>Ukraine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Out of pocket expenditure as a % of all private health expenditure (PvtHE)</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out of pocket expenditure as % of total health expenditures</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General government expenditure on health as a percentage of GDP</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of routine EPI vaccines financed by government, 2010</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>N/A%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


1/ A notable portion of the remaining costs are covered by other donors, particularly.
Policy Level 2.2: Coverage (1/6)

Level of access to essential health interventions are below that of peer countries

- only 36 percent of children with suspected pneumonia receive antibiotics
- 11 percent of children under 5 years old with diarrhea receive oral rehydration salts
Policy Level 2.2: Coverage (5/6)

Net preschool enrollment rate (3-6 year-olds) regional comparison

- In the last 15 years, the ECA countries managed to improve access to preschool by **16** percentage on average.
- Azerbaijan was improved with only about **5** percentage.
Azerbaijan’s preschool enrollment rate (3-6-year-olds) lags peers with smaller GDP per capita (2014/15)
## Benchmarking and International Comparison of ECD in Azerbaijan

### International Classification and Comparison of ECD Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ECD Policy Goal</th>
<th>Policy Lever</th>
<th>Level of Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Establishing an Enabling Environment</strong></td>
<td>Legal Framework</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intersectoral Coordination</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Implementing Widely</strong></td>
<td>Scope of Programs</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coverage</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Equity</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Monitoring and Assuring Quality</strong></td>
<td>Data Availability</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality Standards</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Compliance with Standards</td>
<td>🟢🟢🟢</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Legend:

- **Latent**
- **Emerging**
- **Established**
- **Advanced**