

# Comments to: Ana Revenga “What will it take to eradicate extreme poverty and promote shared prosperity?”



Incubators donated as  
Japan's ODA  
(taken by the author in 2004,  
Dhaka, Bangladesh)

Tatsufumi Yamagata

Institute of Developing Economies, JETRO

# Structure of Yamagata's Talk

## 1. Recapitulation

## 2. Yamagata's Comments

- i. Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)-to-be
- ii. Comparison between WB's targets and those with SDGs
- iii. Yamagata's evaluation of WB's targets over those with SDGs

## 3. Conclusion: Discipline without penalty?

# 1. Recapitulation: Dr. Revenga's talk

- Declaration of WB's own (independent) goals on poverty reduction, inclusive growth and sustainability.
- Analyses on how to achieve the goals.
- Analyses on what worked for poverty reduction and inclusive growth.
- Introduction of some symbolic programs of WB for poverty reduction and inclusive growth.

## **2. Yamagata's Comments**

## i. Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)-to-be

No	Item	No	Item
1	Poverty	10	Equality
2	Hunger, food security and sustainable agriculture	11	City and settlements
3	Health	12	Sustainability in consumption and production
4	Education	13	Climate change
5	Gender equality	14	Conservation of marine resources
6	Water and sanitation	15	Sustainable ecosystem and biodiversity
7	Energy	16	Peace and justice
8	Growth and employment	17	Global partnership
9	Infrastructure and industrialization	Goal (Development) Mean Goal (Environment)	

- **GOAL 1** End poverty in all its forms everywhere
- **GOAL 2** End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture
- **GOAL 3** Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages
- **GOAL 4** Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all
- **GOAL 5** Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
- **GOAL 6** Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all
- **GOAL 7** Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all

- **GOAL 8** Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
- **GOAL 9** Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation
- **GOAL 10** Reduce inequality within and among countries
- **GOAL 11** Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable
- **GOAL 12** Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns
- **GOAL 13** Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts
- **GOAL 14** Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development

- **GOAL 15** Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss
- **GOAL 16** Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
- **GOAL 17** Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development



## ii. Comparison: Relevant targets under Goal 1

- **WB's Goal 1: End extreme poverty**

The percentage of people living with less than \$1.25 a day to fall to no more than 3 percent globally by 2030.

→ Harder target than SDGs' Target 1.2

- **SDGs Goal 1: End poverty in all its forms everywhere**

1.1 By 2030, eradicate extreme poverty for all people everywhere, currently measured as people living on less than \$1.25 a day.

→ Cannot be an effective target because no country can achieve.

1.2 By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions.

→ Local poverty lines are likely to be lower than \$1.25.

## ii. Comparison between WB's targets and those with SDGs (Cont'd)

- WB's target (head count ratio [HCR] of 3%) looks more effective and tougher than SDGs' targets 1.1 and 1.2.
  - SDGs target 1.1 is not effective, because no country achieve the HCR of 0.00000%, strictly speaking.
  - SDGs target 1.1 is an ideal to be pursued forever (in Japanese, 努力目標).
  - SDGs target 1.2 looks easier to be achieved, because in many developing countries the value of HCR is double digits (such as 10% → 5%, which is >3%).
- WB is more ambitious than UN!! (with this respect)

### 3. Conclusion: Discipline without penalty?

- Both SDGs and WB's targets suffer from the incentive issue.
  - Neither penalty nor reward is prepared for WB's targets.
  - SDGs are for the sake of people in both developing and developed countries (this feature is called **universality**).
    - ✓ “SDGs are UNIVERSAL goals, while MDGs were for the sake of only poor people.”
    - ✓ Goals 1-7 of MDGs were associated with a penalty of re-writing of a Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) and reconsideration of donors' Country Assistance Strategies (CAS).
    - ✓ Sustainability issues added, SDGs are tied with “carrot and stick” to a less degree.

### 3. Conclusion: Discipline without penalty? (c'd)

- I still like this attempt of the World Bank!!
  - Some Japanese government officers have already converted.
  - They say “because of the universality feature, SDGs allow developed countries to take more care of income disparity and sustainability issues inside middle and high-income countries than before 2015.”
  - Japan’s new Development Cooperation Charter, which replaced the ODA Charter in this month, endorses this national-interest-pursuing-orientation.
- By contrast, WB’s targets highlight poverty reduction and inclusive growth!!

# References

- [Open Working Group on Sustainable Development Goals \(2014\) \*Open Working Group Proposal for Sustainable Development Goals\*, New York: United Nations.](#)
- [山形辰史 \(2015\)「MDGsを超えてSDGsへ—国際開発の行方—」\(特集:ミレニアム開発目標を超えて\)『アジア研ワールド・トレンド』No. 232 2月号 20-25ページ.](#)