Towards Intrinsically Motivated, Self-Improving Education Systems where Everyone Learns

World Bank
Washington, D.C

Sharath Jeevan, Founder & CEO
sjeevan@stireducation.org

Nithya Gurukumar, Head of Partnerships
ngurukumar@stireducation.org
Overview

1. About STIR
2. Our Values
3. Learning Approach Thus Far
4. SIEF funded-RCT
5. Learning 1: Lightbulb Moments are Key
7. Learning 3: Importance of System Conditions
8. EDT Rapid Learning Evaluation
9. Looking Ahead: System Diagnostics
10. Looking Ahead: System Impact Through More Fertile Soils
11. Looking Ahead: Towards Genuine, Rigorous and Collaborative Discovery
12. Final Thought
About STIR

• Founded in 2012, working across India (Delhi, Karnataka, Maharashtra, Uttar Pradesh) and Uganda

• 750 million children at risk of not learning basic skills by 2030

• Teacher quality most important in-school variable to impact student learning, yet, poor motivation is fueling low teacher effort and poor teaching practice
About STiR

• **Teachers as the solution**, not the problem

• **Government partnerships to run teacher networks**, impacting 75,000 teachers and 2.6 million children

• Teachers meet monthly and experience a **structured journey focused on key classroom principles**
Our Values

We don't have all the answers upfront.

Instead, we empower people: with high expectations and support, we'll find answers together.

We'll continually listen, reflect, learn and improve – and lead through whatever obstacles come our way.

We're united by a shared belief, passion and vision – which we'll build, achieve and grow together.
Our Learning Approach Thus Far

- Rigorous, external impact evaluations
  - SIEF-funded RCT (Delhi APS and Uttar Pradesh)
  - USAID-funded quasi-experimental study (Uttar Pradesh)

- Using innovative evaluation tools
  - Partnership with New York University

- More recent partnerships around formative evaluation on system change
  - DFID-funded study with EDT (Delhi)
SIEF-funded RCT (2015-2017)

- **Formative, 2-year RCT with ID Insight** to assess causal impact of STIR programme on teacher motivation, classroom practice and student learning

- **Delhi** (APS-schools) and **Uttar Pradesh** (government schools), voluntary participation

- **Sample (baseline):**
  - **Delhi** - 1249 teachers surveyed, 342 teachers observed, 3367 students assessed
  - **UP** – 1145 teachers surveyed, 838 teachers observed, 7386 students assessed
SIEF-funded RCT (2015-2017)

- **Effects observed at school level, instead of school level** (on average 20% of teachers had any basic participation in the STIR programme i.e. attended 1 out of 8 network meetings annually in both years)

- **Two treatment arms:**
  - **Standard** = monthly meetings, new ideas are taken back to classroom (in year 2, these were evidence-informed)
  - **Exploratory** = added non-financial extrinsic motivators
SIEF-funded RCT: the tale of two states

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Delhi (APS)</th>
<th>Uttar Pradesh (Government)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Significant results at whole school level:</td>
<td>4 percentage point increase in time spent teaching (8 percentage point in standard schools)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 0.13 sd gain in teacher motivation &amp; 0.15 sd gain in growth-mindset</td>
<td>- Yet, no significant effect on learning outcomes (both treatment and control increased sharply over baseline, bucking overall state trends)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0.18 sd in standard schools)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 13.6 percentage point increase in teacher smiling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 0.15 sd improvement in math learning outcomes for standard schools,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(especially among children with lower baseline levels), 0.1. sd overall</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Learning 1: Lightbulb Moments are Key

- Teacher motivation as critical entry point to address wicked problem

---

**Autonomy**
The desire to direct our own lives

**Mastery**
The urge to get better and better at something that matters

**Purpose**
The yearning to do what we do in the service of something larger than ourselves

**Relatedness**
A sense of belongingness and connectedness to people, groups, or cultures
Learning 2: Intriguing Business Case for Intrinsic Motivation

Short-term cost savings (UP, added teaching time):

$1 \rightarrow $7

Long-term increased earning (Delhi, learning gains):

$1 \rightarrow $100
Learning 3: Importance of Teacher Support Structures and Commitment of System Officials

- Identical fidelity data; **key differences in system support structures:**
  - Dedicated role of Education Leader in Delhi vs teachers being **seconded** into roles in U.P
  - Therefore, lack of **in-person support** to schools between network meetings in UP
  - Content covered in network meetings did not translate into **day-to-day improvements in classroom practice**

- Need to follow up internally on two ‘puzzles’ remaining from study (UP contamination/spillover puzzle, learning outcomes on children directly taught by participating teachers)
EDT Rapid learning evaluation (ongoing) on support structures

• Formative DFID-funded evaluation with EDT in Delhi (public secondary schools)

• Assess key challenges and opportunities as we scale our programme:

  • 1) School leadership is key:
    • Recruitment and Empowering of TDCs (in school support structures)
    • Role model, moral support, contextualizing of programme

  • 2) Importance of Intrinsic Motivation among Head Teachers, MTs and TDCs (key support structures in system)
    • Sense of purpose, accountability
    • Growth-mindset
    • Collaborative, reflective, and problem-solver
Testing Model - rapid learning, rapid iteration to test other impact levers

Move from traditional RCTs to a combination of big data, external sampling and rapid learning cycles, with rapid RCTs to optimize potential impact levers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key measures we will look to test:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Data driven programme improvement – both internally and with the government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Developmental classroom observation and feedback for teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Recruitment &amp; management of Education Leaders (people who run STIR networks)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Engagement of Principals/Head Teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. New Motivation Levers for Teachers and Officials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Testing mechanisms for the government to replicate the model to new districts in their states / countries with limited STIR support</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Testing partnerships with technical partners (particularly around reading)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Greater Emphasis on System Pre Conditions in work going forward

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commitments</th>
<th>Support Structures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clear leadership and vision</td>
<td>Core team at state/national level who will work closely with STIR team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong political support</td>
<td>Minimum support structures at district level to support teacher and head teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will to develop a cadre of people who can take the approach forward</td>
<td>Initial cadre of people who can be trained within districts who will provide leadership for sustainability and replication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alignment with STIR values</td>
<td>Willingness to provide STIR with a strong locus of influence at local, state and national levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment to the process of discovering solutions together</td>
<td>Commitment to aligning the intrinsic motivation approach with other system improvements (eg: technical programmes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>People and financial resources OR a plan to mobilise such resources to ensure efforts are sustained and replicated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Understanding and measuring intrinsic motivation at every level of the system

Every child is engaged, loves learning, feels secure, trusts and values their teacher, and is on a path towards sustainable grade-level proficiency, particularly in reading and math.

Every teacher loves teaching, is continually improving their classroom practice, and is moving on a sustainable path towards mastery.

Every principal and local system official sees children’s learning as their core goal, prioritizes the support of teachers and uses data and insight to continually improve.
## Big implications and learning for STIR overall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For STIR</th>
<th>For Systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>More focused &amp; a unique contribution to the learning crisis.</td>
<td>Unleash people’s collective energy that value teachers and want kids to learn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create deeply co-designed and co-delivered partnerships with joint accountability.</td>
<td>Greater clarity on commitments and support structures we need from government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on innovation and quality so govt can take on the operational and financial aspects of scaling.</td>
<td>We’ll be more responsive to their unique priorities and needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our M&amp;E will now focus on rapid learning and iteration.</td>
<td>No ‘one size fits all’ solution. Co-discovery and co-design process with each system,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We’ll be smaller, nimbler and focus on staff quality and development</td>
<td>Help govts achieve a self-improving education system for the long-haul.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As a learning org, we’ll share learnings and seek advice – to build a shared purpose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank you!

sjeevan@stireducation.org
ngurukumar@stireducation.org