Communications & Outreach in Social Safety Nets

Kathy Lindert, Global Lead for SPL Delivery Systems, The World Bank – May 2018
With Inputs from Zeina Afif, Surat Nsour, Rashiel Velarde, Claudia Baddini Sumaira Sagheer, Quanita Khan, Haleem Kashkol Al-Kazali and others
This session will explore how communication and outreach facilitate reform, enhance policy, inform project design, results and sustainability?

1. Development Communication Framework
2. Communications Strategy, Plan and Process
3. Communication & Outreach in SSN
4. Mapping Stakeholders
5. Communications Along the Delivery Chain
6. Country examples
“The social program that I work with:”

Your answers:
A. Has an active communication strategy
B. Has an active communications team
C. Has a Logo and/or Tagline with clear messaging
D. All of the above
E. None of the above
The social program that I work with

A. Has an active communication strategy

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/llknr60
Development Communication Framework – Broad Principles
What for?

Communication is about:
- Information
- Messaging
- Awareness
- Support
- Dissemination
- Outreach
- Persuasion
- Behavioral Change

...It is also about:
- Building Trust
- Listening
- Mutual Understanding
- Involving Stakeholders
- Exploring & Assessing Issues
- Enhancing Program Design
- Promoting Social Change
- Reconciling Realities
The two orange circles are exactly the same size; however, the one on the left seems smaller.
Risks of Misinformation

- Risk of Negative Spiral
- Lack of Credibility
- Reversal of reforms
- Program failure
- Divisiveness, Politicization
  - Manipulation
  (SMS text example in Brazil)

=> Can’t assume understanding
Social policies, programs, and DELIVERY have to be accompanied by an effective communication strategy that would engage, empower, and enable...
Diagnostics (CBA)

Define Problem Statement

Conduct Situation Analysis
( perception surveys, Qualitative studies, etc. )

Analyze Risks, Identify Opportunities

Identify Audiences & Map Stakeholders

Assess Communication Capacity
1. What are the communication objectives?

2. Who are the primary stakeholders and secondary audiences?

3. What type of change is needed (awareness, attitude, behaviors)?

4. What information is important for them?

5. What communication approaches would be effective?

6. What are the communication channels?

7. What are the messages for each stakeholder?

8. What results do we expect?
# Sample Template for Developing a Communication Strategy

## Communications Strategy matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Communications Context</th>
<th>Project Objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Strategic Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Key Risks</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Current and desired behavior</th>
<th>Messages/Info needs</th>
<th>Channel/Activity</th>
<th>Timing</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Expected Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Work Plan Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Key Risks</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Current and desired behavior</th>
<th>Messages/Info needs</th>
<th>Channel/Activity</th>
<th>Timing</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Expected Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Evaluation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Key Risks</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Current and desired behavior</th>
<th>Messages/Info needs</th>
<th>Channel/Activity</th>
<th>Timing</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Expected Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Communication & Outreach
In Social Safety Nets
In Social Programs, the following types of communication are needed:

Your answers:

A. Participatory communication with applicants and beneficiaries
B. Operational communication among and across implementing agencies
C. Strategic communication with the media, general public
D. Strategic communication with politicians (supportive and opposition)
E. All of the above
In Social Programs, the following types of communication are needed

A. Participatory communication... 3%
Communications in Social Safety Nets

- Develops constituency
- Facilitates service delivery
- Enables social accountability
- Gives ‘voice’ to the poor & marginalized
Key Stakeholders: SSN Programs

- Clients: Beneficiaries & Potential Beneficiaries
- Delivery Agencies
- SSN Program
- Other Partner Agencies
- General Public, Civil Society
- Politicians, Opinion Makers
- Media

Objectives

Messages

Channels

Monitoring, Evaluation, Feedback

For each stakeholder
Communication by Who?

Many “Spokespeople”

- Politicians
- Ministry officials
- Official spokesperson / COMMS team (central, local)
- Local officials as points of contact & communicators
- Hotlines, official website

Communications Protocols

- Clear & consistent messaging
- “Talking Points” (including the “tough ones”)
- Official Use of Logos, etc.
WHEN to Communicate?

Design Phase

- Better inform design
- Reach out to Potential Clients
- Prepare Implementers
- Build awareness & understanding
- Build public support
- Reach out to Influencers

Implementation (delivery)

- Promote Outreach
- Respond to Applicants, grievance redress
- Support Implementation
- Respond to media
- Continue the narrative
- Monitor & evaluate

Continuous!
Communication is crucial in all phases of the Delivery Chain for Social Programs (with “clients,” delivery agencies, etc.).
“For the social program that I work with, the main channel for applicants or beneficiaries to communicate with the program (and vice versa) is through:”

Your answers:
A. Direct contact with program officials at home or in own community
B. Direct contact with officials at local office
C. Online
D. Through a hotline / call center
E. Other?
For the social program that I work with, the main channel for applicants or beneficiaries to communicate with the program (and vice versa) is through?
Communicating with Clients (potential & eventual beneficiaries)

Who should I contact about the program?

How, when & where can I apply for benefits or services?

What documents do I need to apply?

How will the program help me?

How, when & where do I have to recertify?

What is expected of me & my family / children?

When & how will I receive the benefits or services?

How & when will I be notified of the decision?

How & where can I appeal or file a complaint?
Media Habits & Profile of SSN Beneficiaries*

- **Ultra poor** – 68% of beneficiary households under the poverty line
- **Low literacy** – Majority cannot read, write or numerate (96.43% report they could not read)
- **Marginalized** – Lack of mobility and life-skills; cultural, ethnic and language barriers

**Word-of-mouth primary source of information**

- More than 50% penetration of mobile phones - 20.45% own a phone, 52% have access
- Familiar with vernacular & informal tools of outreach, e.g. mosque announcements
- Minimum use of radio, newspaper, banners, TV
- Low recall of IEC Material. Relate to non-verbal, visually strong materials
- Limited level of financial literacy and knowledge of the operation of electronic payment system

*Mott McDonald Spot Check Report Dec 2014*
Communicating with Clients: Participatory Outreach – Pakistan Example

Formation of BISP Beneficiary Groups (BBCs) With Group Mother Leaders

Employing Tactical tools of beneficiary engagement such as:
- Outreach through mother leaders
- Town hall meetings/launch seminars
- Mosque announcements
- Leveraging from ICTs – Robo Calls through mobile phones
- Street theatre

Tehsil Coordinator

Union Counselor

Mother Leader
Communicating with Clients:
Niger CT with “Accompanying Measures for Behavioral Change”

**Behavioral Change Component:**
* Positive Parenting
* Nutrition & Health
* Psycho-social stimulation

**Structured Implementation & Communications:**
* Monthly meetings by NGOs, community educators
  * Home visits
  * Intensity: 3 activities per month
  * Animation techniques

**Lessons Learned**
* Structured content & delivery
  * Participation & interest very high
* Quality focus is essential (continuous training, oversight)
  * Repetition of messages!

**LINK TO VIDEO:**
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QR5009bqjHU
The State shall go where the poor are

The poor shall no longer have to seek help from the State

Communicating with Clients:
Brazil’s Example of “Active Outreach” (Busca Activa) & Importance of Culturally-Appropriate F2F Communications
Communicating with Clients: Brazil Example: Digital Communications
(Messages on withdrawal receipt + iphone APP + SMS texts)

Payment agency (Caixa) informs that Bolsa Familia benefits are being paid according to calendar. Don’t believe Rumors.
The following are examples of communication with implementing agencies:

Your answers:

A. A directive from the Social Ministry to all local agencies about a change in recertification protocols
B. Focus group discussions among local coordinators to surface implementation bottlenecks and solutions
C. An hotline that local agents can call to trained operators with technical questions
D. Electronic communications between coordinators and data entry operators regarding delays in reporting on school attendance conditionalities
E. All of the above
The following are examples of communication with implementing agencies:

A directive from the Social...
Communication with Implementing Agencies @ Local Level

Key Messages

- Objectives of Program or Reforms
- Own roles as “communicators,” points of contact
- Business policies & processes
- Information flows, ICT
- Piloting, training, roll-out

Communications Channels

- 2-way communications (horizontal & vertical)
- Operational manuals
- Updates, announcements
- Electronic bulletins
- Regular reporting
- Seminars, training updates, training videos, capacity building
- Help-line for Technical Questions
- FAQs and tough FAQs.
Communicating with Implementing Agencies @ Local Level
Example: Introducing New Technologies

What do the changes mean for them?

Photos from Azerbaijan

Photo from US
Communicating with Implementing Agencies @ Local Level
Brazil Example – “Novela-Style” training videos

What topics would attract more attention in the press?

Options:

A. A woman named Adriana using cash benefit card to pay for fancy restaurant after parking her car

B. Single mom Erika with 5 kids who doesn’t receive benefits despite obvious conditions of poverty

C. The leakage rate for the Family Benefit program is only 5% to the top quintile of the population
What topics would attract more attention in the press?

A woman named Adriana ... 0%
Answer: Errors of inclusion get more attention in the press (Brazil Example)

Despite the fact that the Bolsa Familia Program is very well targeted to the poor (low errors of inclusion)

Errors of Inclusion receive far more press coverage (and more critical attention)
Proactive Communications
“The battle for public opinion isn’t won with arguments. It’s won by controlling the agenda.”

Build a working relationship with the media:

- Provide steady stream of info (stories!)
- Respond promptly and accurately to queries (positive or negative)
- Reach out to both supportive & adversarial media
- Invite media to key events (SSN Program launches, anniversaries)
- Invite to meetings with beneficiaries in successful areas (testimonials)
- Provide media training (e.g., on impact evaluations, O&C)
Branding

• Product recall, awareness

• Recognizable Name!

• Logo, taglines

• Build a narrative (people remember stories Not information)

• Characterize the brand (convey core values)
Building a brand for the social registry in the Philippines

National Household Targeting System for Poverty Reduction ("NHTSPR")

- Core social policy tool
- Main “spinal cord” of the CCT and other social programs / services
- Operated by the DSWD
- Scientific, Accurate

Communication Assessment showed:

- Confusion on the field of what NHTSPR means
- Limited to association with Pantawid
- NHSTPR as an acronym is difficult to recall

New Brand needed to help with:

- Launching the next round of poverty targeting & registration
- Informing people, improving understanding and appreciation for what the NHTSPR really is
- Promoting unity and consistency nationwide
Market Testing: Branding, Logos, Taglines (Philippines Example)

- **Visuals:**
  - Checkmark = symbol of accuracy
  - House instead of tick-box

- **Tagline:**
  - “Correct Number, Correct Support.”
  - Emphasis on accuracy & response
  - Not over-promising
  - Simple, easy to understand
  - Universal

- **Visuals:**
  - Checkmark = symbol of accuracy
  - Sun = offers hope, uplifting
  - Nationalistic (colors of flag)

- **Taglines:**
  - “Correct Number, Correct Support.”
  - & “Philippines’ national registry of the poor”
  - Not over-promising
  - Simple, easy to understand
  - Universal
Market Testing: Branding, Logos, Taglines (Philippines Example)

- **Visuals:**
  - House shaped by “caring hands”
  - Prevalent color = red, a “feeling color” & from palette of DSWD

- **Tagline:**
  - Conveys “what it is” (NHTS)
  - Caring message on purpose “Giving a name and face to poverty”

- **Visuals:**
  - Arrow = “Targeting”
  - Dark blue & red = DSWD palette

- **Tagline:**
  - Conveys “what it is” (NHTS) but simpler acronym
  - Conveys ultimate goal: aim to reduce poverty
Which do you think is most effective?
Clicker Question 6:
The Social Safety Nets program I work

Your answers:
A. has a brand name that talks to its beneficiaries
B. has customized a responsive beneficiary outreach strategy
C. has accessible local team
D. makes use interpersonal sources of information
E. All of the above
F. None of the above
The Social Safety Nets program I work has a brand name that talk... has customized a response:

Source:
https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/
## Lessons in branding and beneficiary outreach of SSN programs from Kenya and Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Brand Name</th>
<th>Beneficiary Coverage</th>
<th>Program Goals</th>
<th>Beneficiaries</th>
<th>Outreach Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>National Safety Net Program (NSNP)</td>
<td>Inua Jamii</td>
<td>Serves approx. 1.2 Mn beneficiaries across all 47 counties</td>
<td>Cash transfers to uplift and improve welfare of the poor and vulnerable households</td>
<td>Older persons; OVCs; PWSD and food insecure HH</td>
<td>Developed an inclusive Beneficiary Outreach Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>National Social Protection Program (NSPP)</td>
<td>BISP</td>
<td>Serves 5.4 Mn beneficiaries across all provinces and regions</td>
<td>Cash transfers &amp; education CCTs for the poor to enhance human capital and access to complementary services</td>
<td>Women head of the beneficiary households</td>
<td>Has an active Beneficiary Outreach Strategy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
KENYA: CHALLENGE

How to position and communicate Govt of Kenya’s flagship National Safety Net Program (NSNP) that brings together country’s four cash transfer programs under a common (harmonized) operational platform?

**SOLUTION:**

- **Swahili** brand name *Inua Jamii* means ‘to uplift the society’
- Emotive, compelling and transformative
- Makes instant ‘verbal’ and visual’ connection
- Speaks to hearts and minds of vulnerable and marginalized beneficiaries
- Branding is not just the logo – but communicates essence of the program through ways and means it reaches out to beneficiaries to stay relevant, sustainable and impactful
- **Brand visibility** recognizes the spirit of ‘harmonization’ through the use of relevant visuals and language
PAKISTAN: CHALLENGE

How to rebrand a program narrative strongly associated with persona of a popular leader to communicate role of government, while retaining brand equity

SOLUTION:

▪ Retain and build on the brand footprint and brand equity of the name Benazir Income Support Program (BISP)

▪ Dynamic, robust and nationalistic spirit – through revamping the visual story to apolitical imagery

▪ Makes instant ‘verbal’ and visual’ connection

▪ Celebrates a decade of achievement

▪ Symbol of ‘women empowerment’ – human-centric
Effective branding contributes to design and implementation of a responsive Beneficiary Outreach Strategy

- **Relevance** through mechanisms driven by accessibility, association and cost-effectiveness
- **Differentiation** through appropriate channels, format and content

**COMPARABLE ELEMENTS FROM KENYA AND PAKISTAN:**

- **Beneficiary mobilization:** Women leaders of BISP Beneficiary Committees in **Pakistan** & members of Beneficiary Welfare Committees in **Kenya**
- **Vernacular tools of engagement:**
  - Street theatre by local communities for mobilization of beneficiaries in **Pakistan** & Community Barazas by local Chiefs for mobilization in **Kenya**
  - Faith based organizations - Imams through mosque; priests through church for announcements
- **Radio** – a popular tool for community outreach: Public service announcements
- **Mobile telephones** – SMS and IVR technology
LESSONS:

- Role and support of collaborative leadership and accessible local teams
- Inclusive and consultative processes of engagement and outreach
- Build incrementally through testing and learning
- Planning and timeliness in sync with program cycle and work plans
- One size does not fit all - Identify beneficiary preferences and media habits
- Acceptability of vernacular and traditional tools of communication
- Efficient use of technology and ICTs – e.g. mobile telephony; robo-calls; toll-free helplines; biometrics for enhanced accountability and transparency

SOME TECH MYTHS BUSTED

- Illiterate and less exposed would be challenged with technology (people do find the ways when it's in their interest)
- Connectivity would be a problem (not necessarily-- NADRA was able to establish one-stop- registration centers connected with backend databases even in remote areas of Pakistan)
- Banking sector will not be able to cater to large numbers (not really-- the branchless banking and use of POS made the transactions easy to manage)
Communication for reform in FCV Iraq context (cash transfer, CCT, pensions, social development fund, e.g.)

Emergency Social Stabilization and Resilience Project | ESSRP

- Increase livelihood opportunities in liberated areas through Cash for Work
- Increase access to psychosocial support services in liberated areas
- Strengthen the systems to expand the provision of resilient social safety nets

Implementing Agency: Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs

Cash for Work

- Labor-intensive public works
  - IN URBAN COMMUNITIES
    - street sweeping
    - rehabilitating recreational spaces and schools
    - painting public buildings and crosswalks
    - health posts and community buildings
  - IN RURAL COMMUNITIES
    - brushing bushes along access roads
    - breaking rocks for road rehabilitation
    - clearing non-private agricultural land
    - drainage clearance along roads

- IN URBAN COMMUNITIES
  - 150,000 households benefiting from this program
  - 10-million-person work days

Psychosocial Support

- Interventions to help address the mental health among the vulnerable population
- Capacity building for health and social workers

- 150,000 direct beneficiaries (improved mental health)
- 15,000 indirect beneficiaries from capacity building

Livelihood Opportunities

Map showing areas in Iraq with regions such as Kirkuk, Sulaymaniyya, and Baghdad.
Mapping stakeholders and citizens engagement
Mapping Stakeholders

- Local
  - Meet their needs

- Religious Figures

- Supporting Sectors
  - Least important

- Security

- Citizens
  - Key players
  - Keep informed

- Decision makers
  - Social Researcher
  - Civil Community Organizations

- Media
  - Recipients

Interest of stakeholders vs. Influence/power of stakeholders
Iraq CCT monitoring forms for beneficiaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Operation Name</th>
<th>Arabic Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CCT Monitoring</td>
<td>إعانة إضافية مستقبل أفضل</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beneficiaries</td>
<td>النابضين في برنامج الإعانات النقدية الشريحة</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Programs and Activities: |
- Health Services (NPR) |
- Cash Transfers (NPR) |
- Social Welfare (NPR) |

Dates:  
- Initial Distribution: 2023-01-01  
- Last Distribution: 2023-12-31

Program Information: |
- Website: mohas.gov.iq |
- Email: info@mohas.gov.iq |
- UNICEF |
- International Committee of the Red Cross |

Note: The program is subject to change based on government directives.
Key Messages

➢ Well-planned and consistent communications are critical to the success of any reforms.

➢ Allocating adequate budget for communications is an intelligent investment in risk mitigation

➢ Communications professionals should be engaged before the reform program begins and throughout implementation to conduct research, analyze results, and plan and implement the strategic communications program.

➢ Early risk assessment, informing the public in accessible ways, explaining mitigation measures to protect poor and vulnerable households, creating public understanding and building goodwill for a reform process.

➢ Communications plans must be flexible enough to accommodate
Thank You

Community of Learning for Communications, Social Marketing, & Outreach

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FnMKMehI1oM