

8 Simple Things that Can Boost Women' and Girls' Outcomes in SSN interventions While Getting Effective Operations Done



Carine Clert (WBG) based on Joint work with Nicola Jones (ODI) presented at the SPL Global Learning Forum (Washington, DC, June 2015) with inputs from K. Peffley, M. Morton, J. Posadas, K. Dominguez, C. Tesliuc, M. Montenegro and others

SSN Core Course May 2016

WHY THIS SESSION?

Because gender is key to influence effectiveness and equity of Social Protection, and especially SSN interventions...

Merely targeting girls and women is not sufficient

- Poverty and vulnerability as gendered experience, and differences in exposure to shocks and coping strategies
- Patterns of intra-household dynamics key to transfers programs in Social Safety Nets (SSNs): e.g. *who* receives the transfer
- Differences in labor force participation and earnings in old age key to address in the design of efficient and equitable pension schemes
- Different time uses and social norms leading to exclusion of project benefits if overseen by project design

What do some front line Task Managers think?

(2015 Gender stock taking exercise).

“In poor, rural, isolated areas, some women will receive cash for the first time, a point of discussion (and a potential source of conflict) is introduced in the family, in the couple.

We have to be responsible and ensure that proper activities will accompany this process.

Clients are.. moving towards integrated service delivery. This is not just about rearranging benefits but supporting the household and its members to organize itself to seize such opportunities.

We have to work much more on the demand side in our SP interventions, and this implies understanding gender issues and relations and supporting the client to ask the right questions”.

And because of increased evidence that smart SPL interventions can contribute to reduce gender gaps and/or boost women's socio-economic empowerment

SSNs

- Bigger Effects of Cash Transfers on children who may be the most vulnerable: girls' school enrollment, transition between primary and secondary..
- Empowerment of women through SPL delivery systems used to implement cash transfers – e.g. extending bank accounts (Kenya) or ID cards (Pakistan BISP)
- Reduced domestic violence in Mexico, Brazil even if issue remains complex with more research needed
- Effects studied on early marriage (SAR, Malawi), Teenage Pregnancy (CCT Juntos, Peru) and sex ratio (Ladli Scheme in Delhi/Haryana State; Girl Child Protection Scheme in Tamil Nadu; Dhanalakshmi or the CCT scheme for Girl Child)

SO WHAT'S NEXT AND WHAT ARE THE THINGS WE SHOULD HAVE IN OUR CHECKLIST , BOTH IN CONDUCTIVE AND CHALLENGING CONTEXTS...?

What we will cover:

Guidance on what it means to do more and better on gender:

- Removing constraints to economic and social opportunities for women and girls
- Reducing women's economic and social risks
- Promoting resilience, poverty reduction and empowerment among women and girls

Recognizing that what is transformational has to be context specific and can take time: we will strive to provide examples of projects that face challenging contexts

The 9 things

1. Get the **analysis** right
2. Agree on SMART objectives with appropriate **entry-points**
3. Build **implementation capacity** – nationally and locally
4. Look for **win-win delivery mechanisms**
5. Explore and institutionalize **transformative linkages** between core interventions and broader opportunities for women/girls
6. Do not forget to **engage with men/boys and wider communities**
7. Remember **general interventions** can go a long way without being labelled gender-specific actions
8. Develop **strategic indicators** and measure gendered impacts
9. Ensure opportunities for women's/ girls' **feedback** and involvement in program accountability mechanisms

1. Get your analysis right from the beginning (or catch the train during implementation a.s.a.p.)

Two Levels:

- (i) The potential target group
- (ii) The Political and Institutional Context

Example from Jharkhand, India

A household survey and focus groups to inform a planned operation on empowerment of adolescent girls

Assessing what?	For what?
<p>Outcomes e.g., 62% of young women vs 14% of young men NEET (16-24 yrs)</p>	<p>Baseline and policy prioritization</p>
<p>Aspirations & Constraints e.g., father main decision-maker for girls 11-17 and husband for girls 18-24</p>	<p>Project design</p>
<p>Risk & Protective factors e.g., self-efficacy important for young women in urban areas</p>	<p>Project design (modifiable factors) and targeting (non-modifiable factors)</p>
<p>Program preferences e.g., strong demand for entrepreneurship and health education programming</p>	<p>Project design</p>

A toolkit- type summary of what to remember..

Start by asking 4 simple questions:

- i) *What are the key types of vulnerability at the core of your intervention? How are these vulnerabilities experienced by men and women, boys and girls?*
 - E.g. If setting up a **safety net programme in the context of a natural disaster**, need to consider not just gendered environmental vulnerabilities and coping responses, but also vulnerabilities to gender-based violence, health and healthcare, community participation dynamics.
 - ***And don't forget diversity of household types*** – e.g. male vs female vs child-headed hhs; contexts with polygamous hhs etc.

4 simple questions (cont.)

- ii. What are the underlying drivers of these core vulnerabilities?*
- iii. Are these gendered vulnerabilities reflected in national development strategies? In social protection strategies?*
- iv. How are these vulnerabilities already being addressing in existing programming? To what extent have gender dimensions been addressed? What are the gaps?*

Possible data sources

It doesn't have to be expensive or particularly time-consuming

- **Secondary data analysis** for prevalence rates and trends over time – there are multiple and increasingly rich sources (see list next slide)
- **Focus group discussions** (FGDs) with communities, both mixed sex and separate in order to ensure that voices of the poor and vulnerable regarding gendered experiences of poverty and vulnerability are heard;
- **Community score cards** to assess satisfaction with access to and the quality of services designed to tackle poverty and vulnerability;
- **Key informant interviews** with government officers, existing social protection staff, non-governmental organisation (NGO) staff and donors to understand the drivers of gender vulnerabilities;

Possible secondary sources

- SIGI: <http://genderindex.org/>
- Global Gender Gap: <http://www.weforum.org/issues/global-gender-gap>
- Country Gender Assessments
- United Nations Statistics Division: Gender Statistics: <http://unstats.un.org/unsd/gender/default.html>
- World Bank Data on Gender: <http://data.worldbank.org/data-catalog/gender-statistics>
- UNICEF Situation Analyses: <http://www.unicef.org/sitan/> and MICS http://www.unicef.org/statistics/index_24302.htm
- Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women Country reports: <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/reports.htm>
- DHS: www.measuredhs.com
- MDG Progress reports: <http://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/librarypage/mdg/mdg-reports/>
- Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index: <http://www.ifpri.org/publication/womens-empowerment-agriculture-index>
- Barometer surveys (global): <http://www.globalbarometers.org/>

Political economy bottlenecks: 3Is approach

Institutions (formal and informal): creating or preventing opportunities for gender-sensitive social protection?

- Importance of which agency is leading social protection and its relative power (e.g. Ministry of Ag/Rural Dev in Ethiopia's PSNP vs Ministry of Women and Social Affairs for the Basic Social Subsidy Programme in Mozambique)

Interests: which ones are prioritised and by whom?

- Practical gender needs (e.g. communal water points, affordable food to feed family) or transformative goals (e.g. shifts in household gendered power relations/ roles; tackling intimate partner violence; improved access to credit)?
- Who might be potential allies or champions in such a dialogue?

Ideas: how do ideas held by the political elite and the public shape the choice of social protection and commitment to the improvement of gender outcomes?

- **Ghana's** LEAP CT framed in terms of supporting vulnerable citizens to better contribute to the country's push towards MIC status
- **India's** CCTs framed re addressing sex imbalance at birth in context of population control
- **Pakistan's** BISP focuses on tackling gendered poverty and promoting women's full citizenship rights cf predecessor focus on religious obligations

2. Agree on smart development objectives with entry-points for enhanced outcomes for women

In conducive contexts (leaders pushing a gender-responsive agenda)

- *Can be framed in terms of women's empowerment and a rights-based approach*
Constitutional rights (Sth Africa, Brazil), CEDAW, Beijing Platform for Action commitments, ILO conventions

In countries with resistance to the topic, position investment in women/girls as improving:

- *food security: India's MGNREGS, Ethiopia's PSNP*
- *human capital (e.g. nutritional/health/education) outcomes (e.g. Kenya's Cash Transfer for Orphans and Vulnerable Children);*
- *labour market improvements (South Africa's Expanded Public Works Program*
- *poverty reduction: Viet Nam's National Targeted Poverty Reduction Program*
- *MDG achievement (e.g. Filipino Pantawid, Pamilyang Pilipino Program/4Ps)*
- *Religious/cultural obligations, e.g. taking care of widows in Yemen's Social Welfare Fund*

3. Building institutional awareness and capacity

- Factor in and budget for awareness raising and capacity building around gender objectives esp. at subnational levels.
- Ensure capacity strengthening support is tailored and related to day-to-day working practices rather than generic gender mainstreaming training
- When possible, promote performance-based management indicators linked to gender-responsive objectives to ensure gender objectives are taken seriously

In countries with resistance to the topic:

- *Draw on support from Trust Funds from supportive donors (e.g. DFID, GIZ, ILO, UN Women etc.) and forthcoming WBG umbrella gender trust fund*

4. Look for win-win delivery mechanisms – for women and client implementation agencies

Examples in Safety Net Interventions

Cash Transfers. Niger's UCT : zap mobile phone technology to reduce mobility/ time constraints; Pakistan BISP uses debit cards.

Public Works (PWs): India's MGNREGA offers women their own bank accounts cf. social health insurance card in hands of household head.

Ethiopia's PSNP provides direct support for pregnant and nursing mothers, and allows women flexible hours at public works sites to juggle childcare

.. And..

Childcare solutions

Bolivia Children and Youth Employment Project. Provision of affordable child care- higher stipends

Safe spaces

for skills training and internships in terms of preventing sexual harassment

5. Explore transformative linkages between your core intervention and broader opportunities for women

In enabling contexts

PWs: Argentina Jefes provided women with literacy education and family counseling for drug use and domestic violence

El Salvador (with strong political leadership pushing for women's empowerment)

Mexico – links between Progresas/Prospera beneficiaries and Estancias subsidised creche scheme

Income Support and Employability project (WBG project)

Job trainings "Plus": additional activities through inter-institutional efforts: literacy, group education on non-violent conflict resolution, and training on sexual and reproductive rights

One stop shop services a la Ciudad Mujer

Relevant Emerging Innovations in SSNs (contin.)

One-stop services for women with multiple needs and interests. Salvador Ciudad Mujer - (GoS - IADB support)

- Platform with unified vision concentrating in one same space 15 governmental institutions that deliver specialized services for women ensuring that their needs are met on time, with quality and in reliable environment.
- Services delivered by women, including sexual and reproductive health, coordinated response to gender-based violence, economic empowerment and promotion of women's rights.
- Child-care solutions while women have their services delivered.
- Unique Registry
- Cross-referrals to other services
- Safe space
- Transaction costs reduced

Transformative linkages (cont.)

And in more challenging ones

To overcome inequalities/ information asymmetries about complementary services

- Palestinian NCTP links beneficiaries to free social health insurance (esp. important for families with people with disabilities living in poverty);
- Ghana's LEAP also ensures beneficiaries are registered for the free National Health Insurance Scheme

More difficult contexts – low hanging fruits

- Linkages to micro-credit (Palestine's National Cash Transfer Programme in some locales in West Bank); savings and credit schemes (Ethiopia's PSNP Plus in Tigray); to free legal aid (Vietnam's National Targeted Poverty Reduction Programme)

6. Do not forget to engage with men and communities

In SSN interventions

Engaging with men can mitigate against the risks of perpetuating traditional gender norms (reinforcing women's roles as holding the primary responsibility for their children's school and health needs and removing men's responsibility)

In employment promotion and livelihood interventions

Engaging with men and more broadly with communities can be key to shifting attitudes towards girls and women's roles and potentials, especially in challenging contexts

Emerging Innovations in SSNs: Bringing men in parenting and care, promoting transformative dynamics within the household and address gender-based violence



Promundo and Bolsa Familia Companion Program

- Group education encouraging men and women to critically reflect about shared-decision making and power dynamics within their relationships in order to increase the gender-equitable impact of the Program
- Objective: address and prevent the perpetuation of traditional gender norms and potential escalation of violence.

Philippines' 4Ps engages men

- Family development sessions with mothers and fathers on child development and gender equity issues
- Programme indicator of minimum of 40% involvement of men esp. vis-à-vis importance of child literacy

Awareness-raising and work at community-level can make a difference in difficult contexts. The MEGA-Sky Project (India)

Intervention:

- Educational and skills-building opportunities for marginalized children and youth, especially within the Muslim community.
- Worked closely with the **community** to shift attitudes toward women's roles:

Community Support Groups: Mothers' groups and meeting with religious leaders).

Safe environments for community meetings, skills trainings, and coaching for both in school and out-of-school children and youth.

Operated by youth volunteers from the community.

Youth volunteers:

- Half of them women.
- Instructors, links to the community, advocate's for young women's education and role models for other girls.
- Experienced respect from their communities and motivated reluctant parents to become advocate's for girl's education.

7. Develop **strategic indicators** and measure gendered impacts

- Critical to go beyond targeting of female beneficiaries
- Ensure M&E framework and budget to monitor gendered program's impacts
- Be strategic about what indicators you advocate for given limitations of the scope and size of M&E systems
- Examples of key areas:
 - Beneficiary targeting
 - Receipt and use of programme benefits by women/ girls
 - Intra-household impacts
 - Community-level impacts
 - Women's participation in programme governance

Some ways to think beyond mechanic gender-based disaggregation..

Endowments

Education

health

Economic opportunities

Employment

Self-employment and entrepreneurship

Wages and Profits

Voice and Agency

Decision making

Participation in representative bodies

Domestic violence

fertility

For Household – level outcomes

Income
Consumption
& expenditure

.. And implications of potentially useful indicators you can monitor during the life of the project? Some illustrations

Indicator	Dimension of women's empowerment	SSN interventions	Examples
Contribution to household resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased financial independence - Respect given in discussion and negotiation around use of resources 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cash in hands of female members -Coaching for households on managing additional resources and related conflicts -Sensitize SSN Program Practitioners on intra-household dynamics 	

8. Finally, ensure opportunities for women's/ girls' **feedback** and involvement in program accountability mechanisms

- ✓ Inviting feedback is critical for local ownership, improving programme effectiveness and equity, and broader learning
- ✓ Simple measures are possible, and good practice exists
- Uganda's SAGE – regular interaction between implementers and beneficiaries on pay day critical esp in initial programme rollout stages (cf. Palestine where no contact as payment at banks)
- Community council monitoring pilot in West Bank on Palestine's NCTP
- Social audit in India Public Works Program MGNREGA – limited focus on gender to date but potential is there

**So.. To conclude and open further the discussion
in your own working contexts...**



© Fast Company

So.. How did we do on the 8 **points?** Any missing?

1. Get the **analysis** right
2. Agree on SMART objectives with appropriate **entry-points**
3. Build **implementation capacity** – nationally and locally
4. Look for **win-win delivery mechanisms**
5. Explore and institutionalize **transformative linkages** between core interventions and broader opportunities for women/girls
6. Do not forget to **engage with men/boys and wider communities**
7. Develop **strategic indicators** and measure gendered impacts
8. Ensure opportunities for women's/ girls' **feedback** and involvement in program accountability mechanisms

Any concerns .. With regard to your own experience?

Feasibility ?

Affordability?

Priorities ?

Preferred modalities of support to integrate gender

Examples of opportunities in your countries/portfolio?