Minutes of the 1st Meeting of the ICP Task Force on Housing  
October 27, 2017  
World Bank, Washington, DC

Welcome and Meeting Objectives

The first meeting of the International Comparison Program (ICP) Task Force on Housing was held on October 27, 2017 at the World Bank headquarters in Washington, DC.

The main objectives of the meeting were to brief the Task Force on the Terms of Reference, and to initiate the discussions surrounding the ICP Research Agenda item assigned to the Task Force. The meeting agenda and the list of participants are provided in Annex 1 and Annex 2.

Nada Hamadeh, ICP Global Lead, Word Bank, opened the meeting by welcoming the participants and highlighting the topics to be discussed. She noted challenges in estimating Housing PPPs faced during the past rounds of the ICP and emphasized the importance of Task Force’s role in the ICP 2017 cycle.

Background and Terms of Reference

The following presentation was made:
- Terms of Reference for the Task Force, Global ICP Unit, World Bank

Agreements and Conclusions:
- The Task Force accepted the proposed Terms of Reference and the timeline of activities and expected deliverables.
- Alan Heston, ICP Technical Advisory Group member, agreed to act as the Task Force coordinator.

Roundtable Discussion

The following presentations were made:
- Asia’s housing approach in ICP 2011, interim and way forward, Kaushal Joshi and Yuri Dikhanov
- Inter-regional linking of housing in ICP 2011, Alan Heston and Paulus Konijn
- Challenges with housing expenditures in ICP 2011, Michel Mouyelo-Katoula and Inyoung Song

Agreements and Conclusions:
- Countries are asked to collect both rental and quantity data within the ICP 2017 cycle. Countries, Regional Implementing Agencies, and the Global ICP Unit will conduct more thorough validation to assess the consistency between rental data, quantity data and housing expenditures. It was emphasized that quantity data should be thoroughly validated at regional
level, even in regions where rental data is used to calculate regional PPPs, because quantity data will be used for inter-regional linking.

– The inter-regional linking approach will continue to rely on quantity data to link the Eurostat-OECD region that does not collect rental data comparable to other regions. The application of the inter-regional linking approach would be driven by data availability and quality.

– The use of rental data collected in 2016 and 2018 in some regions needs to be assessed by the Task Force with inputs from Regional Implementing Agencies.

– Changing the approach for estimating housing PPPs in Asia needs to be explored, and time series implications needs to be assessed if there is any change in the approach.

– The availability of a note on country practices for compiling housing in national accounts and implementation issues faced would strongly support the validation process.

– Exploring other databases, like Housing Finance Information Network (Hofinet), could help with validating and expanding indicators of housing quality.

To initiate the work, the Task Force agreed on a set of tasks below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paper on target measures</td>
<td>Draft a paper on the target measures for housing within the ICP, including the sources of inconsistencies between rental data, quantity data and housing expenditures, and their impact on the reliability of resulting real volumes and/or PPPs.</td>
<td>Alan Heston, Niall O’Hanlon and the Global ICP Unit [Paulus Konijn to review]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing guidelines on housing expenditures</td>
<td>Share with the Task Force Eurostat’s existing guidelines on imputing expenditures for owner-occupied housing, including rental equivalence and user-cost methods.</td>
<td>Paulus Konijn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collecting additional metadata from countries</td>
<td>Prepare a note/questionnaire to ask countries to provide additional information on their rental survey coverage and the process to estimate their national annual averages.</td>
<td>Global ICP Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanding quality indicators</td>
<td>Explore the use of additional housing quality indicators. This could include using indicators compiled by other organizations such the UN, or consulting countries on other quality indicators/parameters that could help in estimating housing PPPs.</td>
<td>Kaushal Joshi (w/ADB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting the validation process</td>
<td>Explore the possibility of preparing a note on country practices for compiling housing in national accounts and implementation issues faced.</td>
<td>Niall O’Hanlon (w/IMF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploring alternative data sources</td>
<td>Explore using alternative data sources such as online or agency listings to collect rental data.</td>
<td>Michel Mouyelo-Katoula (w/AfDB)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way Forward**

– The Global ICP Unit will set-up a [Microsoft OneDrive](#) folder for data and information sharing and invite the Task Force members to join the folder.
- The Global ICP Unit will draft confidentiality statement agreements to be signed by the Task Force, similarly to the 2011 ICP practice.
- The Global ICP Unit will stand ready to support all work undertaken by the Task Force.
- The next meeting of the Task Force will be organized in conjunction with the Inter-Agency Coordination Group meeting, most likely in March 2018.
## Annex 1: Meeting Agenda

**Friday, October 27, 2017**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Task Force</th>
<th>Housing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30 – 09:00</td>
<td>Breakfast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00 – 09:30</td>
<td>Background and TORs</td>
<td>Overall objectives, <em>Nada Hamadeh</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Terms of Reference for the Task Force, <em>Inyoung Song</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:30 – 10:00</td>
<td>Asia’s housing approach in ICP 2011, interim and ICP 2017</td>
<td><em>Kaushal Joshi and Yuri Dikhanov</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 – 11:00</td>
<td>Inter-regional linking of housing in ICP 2011, interim and ICP 2017</td>
<td><em>Alan Heston and Paulus Konijn</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 – 11:30</td>
<td>Expenditures for housing</td>
<td>Challenges with housing expenditures in ICP 2011, <em>Michel Mouyelo-Katoula and Inyoung Song</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30 – 12:00</td>
<td>Way forward</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 2: List of Participants

Task Force Members
- Kaushal Joshi, Asian Development Bank
- Niall O’Hanlon, IMF
- Paulus Konijn, Eurostat
- Bettina Aten, United States Bureau of Economic Analysis
- Alan Heston, University of Pennsylvania
- Yuri Dikhanov, World Bank
- Inyoung Song, World Bank

Global ICP Unit
- Nada Hamadeh, World Bank
- Marko Olavi Rissanen, World Bank
- Mizuki Yamanaka, World Bank
- Maurice Nsabimana, World Bank
- William Vigil Oliver, World Bank
- Hanan Abu Shanab, World Bank

Regional Implementing Agencies
- Gregoire Mboya Deloubassou, African Development Bank
- Rees Mpofu, African Development Bank
- Anouar Chaouch, African Development Bank
- Marjanca Gasic, Eurostat
- Andrey Kosarev, Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States
- Valerica Accibas, Interstate Statistical Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States
- Vasily Kuznetsov, Russian Federal State Statistics Service
- Francette Koechlin, OECD
- Majed Skaini, UN Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia
- Federico Dorin, UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
- Maria Paz Collinao, UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean

Experts
- Dilip Kumar Sinha, India Ministry of Statistics and Program Implementation
- Patrick Kelly, National Statistical Office of South Africa
- Sergey Sergeev, Statistics Austria
- Luigi Biggeri, University of Florence
- Prasada Rao, University of Queensland