DIME EVALUATION TRAINING AND PRESENTATION OF NIPEP BASELINE AND PILOT RESULTS

Dr. Folake Olatunji-David, Deputy Director & National M&E Officer

Dr. Victor Orozco-Olvera, Economist, World Bank DIME

Abuja, Nigeria, September 27, 2019
Motivation

• The world faces a learning crisis (2018 WDR).

• Despite important progress, many children remain out of school in the 5 NW states served by NIPEP.

• 3% percent of 2nd grade pupils can read a text in Hausa with at least eighty percent comprehension (2014 RARA).
Motivation

• **Adverse social norms** towards education, especially girl education.

• Illiterate parents **lack of self-efficacy beliefs** to be able to help their children.

• Parents and children caught in **low aspiration traps**, they often **lack role models**.

• Children lack **(engaging) educational materials**.
La colaboración started at DIME’s Narrating Behavior Change IE Workshop (Mexico City, May 2016)
... and has grown ever since.
Study location and sample

- Study is taking place in Kano and Jigawa states.

- 120 school catchment areas (75 HH/CA, n=9,000).

- Eligibility criteria: Households with 6-9 year old in-school and out-of-school children.
The NIPEP impact evaluation tests two media entertainment interventions:

Movies and Apps
Treatment 1: Social Norms campaigns

- 2 community sensitization sessions (4 hours in total)
- Community leader sanction new norm.
- School principal explains the average school day.
- Discovery Learning Alliance edu-tainment screenings include aspirational, self-efficacy and educational messages.
- Female NGO facilitators lead the sessions, serving as role models.
• My Better World explores personal strengths and their development combining entertaining animation with real-life issues and documentary segments.

• Adjusted and focus-grouped for Northern Nigeria audiences.
Technology Reaches People Faster

Number of years to reach 100 million users

- Telephone (1878)
- Mobile (1979)
- Internet (1990)
- Facebook (2004)
- Whatsapp (2009)
- Instagram (2010)

Source: Adapted from World Economic Forum, 2017
Mobile connectivity has already shown that we can achieve faster, cheaper solutions in many critical development areas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development need</th>
<th>Digital pathway</th>
<th>Through coordinated investment</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.2b people need access to power</td>
<td>Off-grid startups are already providing power to 50 million people</td>
<td>Scaled up, distributed generation can improve access for 250mm people</td>
<td>mobisol Prepaid Energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70% of SMEs in EMs lack access to markets/credit</td>
<td>Taobao provides 4.5 million SMEs in China with expanded access to markets/credit</td>
<td>Development of similar models in other EMs can benefit 5mm more SMEs</td>
<td>Taobao.com</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>~4% of children &lt;5yo die due to poor healthcare</td>
<td>Propeller reduced by 100% the asthma-related hospitalizations for its 10,000 users</td>
<td>25mm patients could get improved access to basic healthcare</td>
<td>Propeller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>250mm students in India are behind in learning</td>
<td>Byju’s technology is helping 0.5mm student subscribers better understand concepts</td>
<td>20mm children could receive a high-quality education</td>
<td>BYJU'S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55% of the adults in EMs don't have a bank account</td>
<td>bKash provides accounts to 25mm people in Bangladesh (more than all the Banks)</td>
<td>500 million people could become financially included</td>
<td>bKash</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Treatment 2: Literacy Apps as reinforcers

- In half of T1 communities, we gave smartphones with 2 pre-loaded literacy apps designed for low-literacy populations.
- Apps incorporate pedagogy insights and have been tested in different contexts.

“Studying”
App 1: “Feed the Monster” teaches how to read.

The King of Kannywood lent his monster voice.
App 2: Has hundreds of books in Hausa.
What is the causal impact on:

1. Primary school enrollment, retention and attendance rates?
2. Children’s (6-9 yo) aspirations, self-efficacy and attitudes related to educational goals?
3. Parents’ aspirations, self-efficacy and attitudes related to their children’s educational goals?
4. Study hours of children?
5. Children’s learning outcomes (i.e., EGRA tests)?
6. Do effects vary by gender (study is powered for gender heterogenous effects)? Do effects vary for other key variables?
7. Do we see an additional effects of T2 over T1?
Why do an impact evaluation?

What is its value-added with respect to M&E?
What to scale up?

Better causal estimates help the investment decision.
WHY CAUSAL INFERENCE?

IT IS EASY TO CONFUSE CORRELATION WITH CAUSATION
M&E

• Monitoring tracks indicators over time
  • Among participants

• It is descriptive before-after analysis

• It tells us whether things are moving in the right direction

• It does not tell us \textbf{why} things happen or \textbf{how} to make more happen
According to monitoring, test scores were not affected: Is teachers’ training not effective at increasing learning?
TO LOOK AT CAUSAL LINKS USE IMPACT EVALUATION

• Tracks mean outcomes over time in
  • the treatment group *relative to*
  • the control group

• Compares
  • what *DID* happen with
  • what *WOULD HAVE* happened (counterfactual)

• Identifies *causal output-outcome* link
  • separately from the effect of other time-varying factors
According to evaluation, the intervention had a positive effect: it reduced the decline in test scores.
How do we get to causality?  
Counterfactual Analysis

- Compare one individual  
  - with & without intervention  
  - at the same point in time  

  This is impossible

- Compare statistically identical groups of individuals  
  - with & without intervention  
  - at the same point in time  

  This is possible
Treated & control groups

• Have identical initial average characteristics (observed and unobserved)

• The only difference is the treatment

• Therefore the only reason for the difference in outcomes is due to the treatment
• Randomly assign intervention (if feasible)
• Use clear and measurable assignment criteria (if not)
• Collect data on treatment and control groups
• Compare mean outcomes over time
What is DIME?

conduct
rigorous research
generate
actionable data
and evidence
inform
real-time decisions
increase
policy effectiveness
Country Engagements

Geographical Distribution
Total IEs

203 IEs across 52 countries
DIME i2i thematic pillars

Gender
- Human capital
- Economic opportunities
- Voice/agency

Fragility, Conflict and Violence
- Economic/social reintegration
- Governance
- Gender-based violence
- Urban crime and violence

Agriculture
Energy & Environment
Edutainment
Financial & Private Sector Development
Governance
Transport
DIME Narrating Behavior Change
The Entertaining Way to Behavioral Change: Fighting HIV with MTV (Banerjee, La Ferrara and Orozco, 2019)

- Produced by MTV Staying Alive Foundation.
- 3rd season (3 hours) shot in Nigeria.
- Broadcasted in all Sub Sahara Africa.

Engaging stories.
After 8-10 months of exposure of

- HIV Testing *doubled*
- Chlamydia infections were *halved*
- Sexual concurrency was halved
- Viewer *friends’* became for HIV knowledgeable.
- 30-50% decrease in sexual and physical violence.
- *Program transportation and character-identification* greatly drove results.
Pilot results of T1 and T2 (Jan 2019) suggest we are on the right track.

Though we will only know in 2020.
Thank you!

World Bank Development Impact Evaluation (DIME)  
2019 DIME Report