Communications & Outreach in Social Safety Nets

Surat Nsour, with inputs from Delivery Systems GSG and Sourcebook colleagues
SPJ Global Practice
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dk4S9zRU6nE
This session will explore how can communication and outreach facilitate reform, enhance policy, inform project design, results and sustainability?

- Development Communication Framework
- Communications Strategy, Plan and Process
- Communication & Outreach in SSN Along the Delivery Chain
- Mapping Stakeholders
- Branding
- Country examples
- Key Messages
“The social program that I work with:”

Your answers:
A. Has an active communication strategy
B. Has an active communications team
C. Has a Logo and/or Tagline with clear messaging
D. All of the above
E. None of the above
The social program that I work with:

A. Has an active communication strategy 0%
B. Has an active communications team 0%
C. Has a Logo and/or Tagline... 0%
D. All of the above 0%
E. None of the above 0%

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/spidp6pb
Development Communication Framework
– Broad Principles
What for?

Communication is about:
- Information
- Messaging
- Awareness
- Support
- Dissemination
- Outreach
- Persuasion
- Behavioral Change

...It is also about:
- Building Trust
- Listening
- Mutual Understanding
- Involving Stakeholders
- Exploring & Assessing Issues
- Enhancing Program Design
- Promoting Social Change
- Reconciling Realities
Risks of Misinformation

• Risk of Negative Spiral
  • Lack of Credibility
  • Reversal of reforms
    • Program failure
  • Divisiveness, Politicization
    • Manipulation
      (SMS text example in Brazil)

=> Can’t assume understanding
Most Programs pass through similar implementation phases along the Delivery Chain.

Communications throughout the SSN Delivery Chain
Social policies, programs, and delivery have to be accompanied by an effective communication strategy that would engage, empower, and enable.
Diagnostics (CBA)

Define Problem Statement

Conduct Situation Analysis
(perception surveys, Qualitative studies, etc.)

Analyze Risks, Identify Opportunities

Identify Audiences & Map Stakeholders

Assess Communication Capacity
Communication Strategy Development

1. What are the communication objectives?
2. Who are the primary stakeholders and secondary audiences?
3. What type of change is needed (awareness, attitude, behaviors)?
4. What information is important for them?
5. What communication approaches would be effective?
6. What are the communication channels?
7. What are the messages for each stakeholder?
8. What results do we expect?
Mapping Stakeholders

- Media
  - Key players
  - Recipients
  - Social Researcher
  - Civil Community Organization

- Decision makers
  - The Minister

- Religious Figures

- Supporting Sectors
  - Least important

- Security

- Citizens

- Influence/power of

- Interest of stakeholders

- Meet their needs
## Sample Template for Developing a Communication Strategy

**Communications Strategy matrix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Key Risks</th>
<th>Audience</th>
<th>Current and desired behavior</th>
<th>Messages/Info needs</th>
<th>Channel/Activity</th>
<th>Timing</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Expected Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Communication & Outreach
In Social Safety Nets
In Social Programs, the following types of communication are needed:

Your answers:

A. Participatory communication with applicants and beneficiaries
B. Operational communication among and across implementing agencies
C. Strategic communication with the media, general public
D. Strategic communication with politicians (supportive and opposition)
E. All of the above
In Social Programs, the following types of communication are needed:

A. Participatory communication 0%
B. Operational communication 0%
C. Strategic communication 0%
D. Strategic communication 0%
E. All of the above 0%

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/sp-r0t705
Develops constituency
Facilitates service delivery
Enables social accountability
Gives ‘voice’ to the poor & marginalized

Communications in Social Safety Nets

Strategic Communication
 Operational Communication & Outreach
Key Stakeholders: SSN Programs

Objectives

Messages

Channels

Monitoring, Evaluation, Feedback

For each stakeholder

SSN Program

“Clients” Beneficiaries & Potential Beneficiaries

Delivery Agencies

Media

Politicians, Opinion Makers

General Public, Civil Society

Other Partner Agencies

For each stakeholder
Communication by Who?

Many “Spokespeople”
- Politicians
- Ministry officials
- Official spokesperson / COMMs team (central, local)
- Local officials as points of contact & communicators
- Hotlines, official website

Communications Protocols
- Clear & consistent messaging
- “Talking Points” (including the “tough ones”)
- Official Use of Logos, etc.
WHEN to Communicate?

Design Phase

- Better inform design
- Reach out to Potential Clients
- Prepare Implementers
- Build awareness & understanding
- Build public support
- Reach out to Influencers

Implementation (delivery)

- Promote Outreach
- Respond to Applicants, grievance redress
- Support Implementation
- Respond to media
- Continue the narrative
- Monitor & evaluate

Continuous!
### Typology of Outreach Modalities used in Social Protection Programs and Delivery Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct Outreach</th>
<th>On-demand with outreach officers (in local offices, satellite offices, kiosks)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Modalities</td>
<td>Mobile teams: going door-to-door, to neighborhoods or communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community-Based</td>
<td>Peer-to-peer outreach and mentoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach</td>
<td>Community-based outreach—rely on local capacities for disseminating info, connecting people: community leaders, mother groups, faith-based leaders, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach via Intermediaries</td>
<td>Personal referrals from other professionals or programs, Disseminate info, promote awareness via other services: schools, health clinics, shelters, jails Information and outreach via other groups and organizations, employer or trade associations, foundations, community organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indirect outreach</td>
<td>Printed media: brochures, bulletins, posters Mass media: TV, radio, newspapers, social media Websites, online self-service windows, hotlines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors' compilation based on: Dewson et. al., (2006); Mosley et. al. (January 2018); Scoppetta and Buckenleib (May 2018).
“For the social program that I work with, the main channel for applicants or beneficiaries to communicate with the program (and vice versa) is through:”

Your answers:
A. Direct contact with program officials at home or in own community
B. Direct contact with officials at local office
C. Online
D. Through a hotline / call center
E. Other?
For the social program that I work with, the main channel for applicants or beneficiaries to communicate with the program (and vice versa) is through:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Direct contact with program</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Direct contact with official</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Online</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Through a hotline / call</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Other</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/spd43h28
Communicating with Clients
(potential & eventual beneficiaries)

Who should I contact about the program?

How, when & where can I apply for benefits or services?

What documents do I need to apply?

How will the program help me?

How, when & where do I have to recertify?

What is expected of me & my family / children?

When & how will I receive the benefits or services?

How & when will I be notified of the decision?

How & where can I appeal or file a complaint?
Media Habits & Profile of SSN Beneficiaries*

Word-of-mouth primary source of information

More than 50% penetration of mobile phones - 20.45% own a phone, 52% have access

Familiar with vernacular & informal tools of outreach, e.g. mosque announcements

Minimum use of radio, newspaper, banners, TV

Low recall of IEC Material. Relate to non-verbal, visually strong materials

Limited level of financial literacy and knowledge of the operation of electronic payment system

Ultra poor – 68% of beneficiary households under the poverty line
Low literacy – Majority cannot read, write or numerate (96.43% report they could not read)
Marginalized – Lack of mobility and life-skills; cultural, ethnic and language barriers

* Mott McDonald Spot Check Report Dec 2014
Communicating with Clients:
Niger CT with “Accompanying Measures for Behavioral Change”

Behavioral Change Component:
* Positive Parenting
* Nutrition & Health
* Psycho-social stimulation

Structured Implementation & Communications:
* Monthly meetings by NGOs, community educators
  * Home visits
  * Intensity: 3 activities per month
  * Animation techniques

Lessons Learned
* Structured content & delivery
  * Participation & interest very high
  * Quality focus is essential (continuous training, oversight)
  * Repetition of messages!

LINK TO VIDEO:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QR5009bqjHU
 Communicating with Clients: Brazil’s Example of “Active Outreach” (Busca Activa) & Importance of Culturally-Appropriate F2F Communications

The State shall go where the poor are

The poor shall no longer have to seek help from the State
Communicating with Clients:
Brazil Example: Digital Communications
(Messages on withdrawal receipt + iphone APP + SMS texts)

Payment agency (Caixa) informs that Bolsa Familia benefits are being paid according to calendar. Don’t believe Rumors…
The following are examples of communication with implementing agencies:

Your answers:
A. A directive from the Social Ministry to all local agencies about a change in recertification protocols
B. Focus group discussions among local coordinators to surface implementation bottlenecks and solutions
C. An hotline that local agents can call to trained operators with technical questions
D. Electronic communications between coordinators and data entry operators regarding delays in reporting on school attendance conditionalities
E. All of the above
The following are examples of communication with implementing agencies:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. A directive from the Soc...</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Focus group discussions...</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. An hotline that local age...</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Electronic communication...</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. All of the above</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/sp-5uf1cg
Communication with Implementing Agencies @ Local Level

Key Messages

- Objectives of Program or Reforms
- Own roles as “communicators,” points of contact
- Business policies & processes
- Information flows, ICT
- Piloting, training, roll-out

Communications Channels

- 2-way communications (horizontal & vertical)
- Operational manuals
- Updates, announcements
- Electronic bulletins
- Regular reporting
- Seminars, training updates, training videos, capacity building
- Help-line for Technical Questions
- FAQs and tough FAQs.
Communicating with Implementing Agencies @ Local Level
Example: Introducing New Technologies

What do the changes mean for them?

Photos from Azerbaijan

Photo from US
What topics would attract more attention in the press?

Options:
A. A woman named Adriana using cash benefit card to pay for fancy restaurant after parking her car
B. Single mom Erika with 5 kids who doesn’t receive benefits despite obvious conditions of poverty
C. The leakage rate for the Family Benefit program is only 5% to the top quintile of the population
What topics would attract more attention in the press?

A. A woman named Adriana using cash benefit card to pay for fancy restaurant after parking her car
   0%

B. Single mom Erika with 5 kids who doesn’t receive benefits despite obvious conditions of poverty
   0%

C. The leakage rate for the Family Benefit program is only 5% to the top quintile of the population
   0%

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/spvshy4z
Answer: Errors of inclusion get more attention in the press (Brazil Example)

Errors of Inclusion receive far more press coverage (and more critical attention)

Despite the fact that the Bolsa Familia Program is very well targeted to the poor (low errors of exclusion)
Proactive Communications

“The battle for public opinion isn’t won with arguments. It’s won by controlling the agenda.”

Build a working relationship with the media:

• Provide steady stream of info (stories!)
• Respond promptly and accurately to queries (positive or negative)
  • Reach out to both supportive & adversarial media
• Invite media to key events (SSN Program launches, anniversaries)
• Invite to meetings with beneficiaries in successful areas (testimonials)
  • Provide media training (e.g., on impact evaluations, O&C)
Branding

• Product recall, awareness

• Recognizable Name!

• Logo, taglines

• Build a narrative
  (people remember stories
  Not information)

• Characterize the brand
  (convey core values)
Building a brand for the social registry in the Philippines

National Household Targeting System for Poverty Reduction ("NHTSPR")

- Core social policy tool
- Main “spinal cord” of the CCT and other social programs / services
- Operated by the DSWD
- Scientific, Accurate

Communication Assessment showed:

- Confusion on the field of what NHTSPR means
- Limited to association with Pantawid
- NHTSPR as an acronym is difficult to recall

New Brand needed to help with:

- Launching the next round of poverty targeting & registration
- Informing people, improving understanding and appreciation for what the NHTSPR really is
- Promoting unity and consistency nationwide
Market Testing: Branding, Logos, Taglines (Philippines Example)

• **Visuals:**
  - Checkmark = symbol of accuracy
  - House instead of tick-box

• **Tagline:**
  - “Correct Number, Correct Support.”
  - Emphasis on accuracy & response
  - Not over-promising
  - Simple, easy to understand
  - Universal

• **Visuals:**
  - Checkmark = symbol of accuracy
  - Sun = offers hope, uplifting
  - Nationalistic (colors of flag)

• **Taglines:**
  - “Correct Number, Correct Support.”
  - & “Philippines’ national registry of the poor”
  - Not over-promising
  - Simple, easy to understand
  - Universal
Market Testing: Branding, Logos, Taglines (Philippines Example)

**Visuals:**
- House shaped by “caring hands”
- Prevalent color = red, a “feeling color” & from palette of DSWD

**Tagline:**
- Conveys “what it is” (NHTS)
- Caring message on purpose “Giving a name and face to poverty”

**Visuals:**
- Arrow = “Targeting”
- Dark blue & red = DSWD palette

**Tagline:**
- Conveys “what it is” (NHTS) but simpler acronym
- Conveys ultimate goal: aim to reduce poverty
Clicker Question: Which do you think is most effective?

• Which branding logo do you think is more effective?
Which branding logo do you think is more effective?

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/sp-obnu8w
Clicker Question:
The Social Safety Nets program I work with?

Your answers:
A. has a brand name that talks to its beneficiaries
B. has customized a responsive beneficiary outreach strategy
C. has accessible local team
D. makes use of interpersonal sources of information
E. All of the above
F. None of the above
The Social Safety Nets program I work with?

A. has a brand name that talks to its beneficiaries 0%
B. has customized a response 0%
C. has accessible local team 0%
D. makes use interpersonal sources of information 0%
E. All of the above 0%
D. None of the above 0%

Source: https://api.cvent.com/polling/v1/api/polls/sp-z148b7
Effective branding contributes to design and implementation of a responsive Beneficiary Outreach Strategy

Relevance through mechanisms driven by accessibility, association and cost-effectiveness

Differentiation through appropriate channels, format and content

COMPARABLE ELEMENTS FROM KENYA AND PAKISTAN:

• **Beneficiary mobilization:** Women leaders of BISP Beneficiary Committees in **Pakistan** & members of Beneficiary Welfare Committees in **Kenya**

• **Vernacular tools of engagement:**
  • Street theatre by local communities for mobilization of beneficiaries in **Pakistan** & Community Barazas by local Chiefs for mobilization in **Kenya**
  • Faith based organizations - Imams through mosque; priests through church for announcements

• **Radio** – a popular tool for community outreach: Public service announcements

• **Mobile telephones** – SMS and IVR technology
Communication for reform in FCV Iraq context (cash transfer, CCT, pensions, social development fund, e.g.)
Mapping stakeholders & citizens engagement
Iraq CCT monitoring forms for beneficiaries
BURUNDI CASE: Perceptions towards cash transfer

Central Gov: laziness/dependency overtime
Local authority: no trust in targeting methodology
Community: free money against religious beliefs,
Households: manpower challenged with women as main recipient of cash
Outreach & communication / Community based facilities

SMS for IEC key messages
Hotline & GRM

Messages through Churches, local assemblies

use of radio, newspaper, banners, TV

IEC Material. Verbal & non-verbal, visually strong materials
Communicating with Clients: Burundi CT with “Accompanying Measures for Behavioral Change”

Behavioral Change Component:
* Positive Parenting, ECD, Education
  * Nutrition & Health
  * Reproductive Health; Financial Literacy

Structured Implementation & Communications:
* Bi-Monthly meetings by NGOs, community workers
  * Home visits
  * Best practices demonstrations

Lessons Learned
* Structured content & delivery
  * Participation & interest very high
  * Quality focus is essential (continuous training, oversight)
  * Repetition of messages!
NEW CHALLENGES COMING:

• COMMUNICATIONS STRATEGY DURING ELECTIONS:

EXPERIENCES FROM OTHER COUNTRIES???
Governance Structure and Institutional Arrangements

Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services (MFLSS) and General Directorate of Social Assistances (GDSA) ~2,000 employees (~500 ISAS end-users)

1,000 local Social Assistance and Solidarity Foundations (SASFs) ~10,000 employees (ISAS end-users)

Population coverage for Social Assistance Programs and Universal Health Coverage ~10+ million HHs (40+ Milyon individuals)

Relevant public entities, municipalities, and NGOs

Source: Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Social Assistance Statistical Bulletin (2016)
Implementation of SSN Programs: Highly Decentralized through Local SASFs

- Social Assistance and Solidarity Foundations (SASFs) are the **implementation body** of SSN programs in Turkey.
- Established as **private-legal entities**
- Located in each district (**highly-decentralized**)
- **No hierarchy** among SASFs or between MFLSS & GDSA
- Have **separate decision bodies** called “Board of Trustees” constituted by highest district level officials several entities.

**Effective usage of local knowledge**

- Inclusion of several public entities’ perspectives
- Cross-coordination across all actors
- **Strong consensus in decision making**
- Quick decision making and acting capacity

Source: Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services
What is ISAS? And how communication supports the operation

**Assess**
- **Administrative Data**
  - Social Sec.
  - Housing
  - Tax
  - Health
  - Employment
  - Education
  - Banking
  - Cadastral
  - Social Reg.
  - Address
  - Assets
  - Banking

**Data from Field Visits**
- HH visits (data collection by physical interaction)
- HH visits by ~5,000 social assst. workers in 1,000 SASFs

**Enroll**
- **Administrative Data**
  - Data from Field Visits
  - Board of Trustees
  - Decision
    - (on eligibility and benefits package)

**Provide/Monitor**
- **Administrative Data**
  - Data from Field Visits
  - Proxy-Means Testing for UHI
  - Proxy-Means Testing for SP

**Streamlined flow of information** between agencies and programs to create and update beneficiary profiles (real-time data collection from administrative sources)

Linked with 24 Public Entities with over 120+ webservices

"Dynamic & Integrated" gateway for multiple (17+) SP programs

Covers 10+ million households and 40+ million individuals.

What is ISAS? And how communication supports the operation
Communication is the key for effective beneficiary monitoring & management

- **Beneficiary Profile Updates & Checking Compliance to Conditionalities**
  - **INPUT**
  - **OUTPUT**
  - **Recurrent Process**

1. Maintain eligibility and keep benefiting from services and transfers
2. Exit from the program(s)
3. Trigger field visits for social workers
4. Initiate recertification process

**Categories**
- Education & Health
- Assets
- ID & Social Sec & Emp.
- Other Social Asst.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actors</th>
<th>Channels</th>
<th>Tools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Local actors (SASF workers, Village Heads (+50,000), district level government officials)</td>
<td>• Online Channels (CIMER, Ombudsman, etc.)</td>
<td>• Turkey’s ISAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Governors (PR offices at district and province level)</td>
<td>• Free Hot-line (Alo 144, call center)</td>
<td>• CIMER Platform integrated with eGovernment Portal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Political Figures</td>
<td>• Walk-in (SASF, PR offices)</td>
<td>• Petition (online and hard copy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• HH Visits</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LESSONS:

- Role and support of **collaborative leadership and accessible local teams**
- Inclusive and consultative processes of engagement and outreach
- **Build incrementally through testing and learning**
- Planning and timeliness in sync with program cycle and work plans
- One size does not fit all - Identify beneficiary preferences and media habits
- Acceptability of vernacular and traditional tools of communication
- **Efficient use of technology and ICTs** – e.g. mobile telephony; robo-calls; toll-free helplines; biometrics for enhanced accountability and transparency

SOME TECH MYTHS BUSTED

- Illiterate and less exposed would be **challenged with technology** (people do find the ways when it's in their interest)
- Connectivity would be a problem
- Banking sector will not be able to cater to large numbers (not really – the branchless banking and use of POS made the transactions easy to manage)
Key Messages

Well-planned and consistent communications are critical to the success of any reforms.

Allocating adequate budget for communications is an intelligent investment in risk mitigation.

Communications professionals should be engaged before the reform program begins and throughout implementation to conduct research, analyze results, and plan and implement the strategic communications program.

Early risk assessment, informing the public in accessible ways, explaining mitigation measures to protect poor and vulnerable households, creating public understanding and building goodwill for a reform process.

Communications plans must be flexible enough to accommodate
Thank You

Community of Learning for Communications, Social Marketing, & Outreach

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FnmKMehl1oM