Productive Accompanying Measures to Safety Nets in the Sahel ASP Program: the case of Niger

Building Household Resilience through Productive Inclusion

Ms. Yahaya Saadatou Mallam Barmou
Deputy of the Director of the Prime Minister's Office of the Republic of Niger
Safety Nets in Niger

• National Safety Nets Program set-up in 2011 in the Office of the Prime Minister office
  – Establish a permanent safety nets system (rather than perpetuate ad hoc emergency response to crisis)
  – Covers all regions in Niger
  – Reached about ~1 million individuals by 2017

• Two main instruments:
  – Cash transfer program with accompanying measures
  – Cash-for-works program (public works)
Cash Transfer Program

- Cash transfer program supports chronic poor and vulnerable households by providing regular income transfers and encourage investments in human capital.

- Monthly transfers of $20 (10,000 FCFA) per month for 24 months (Equivalent to 15% of poverty line)

- Geographical selection of poorest communes, and proxy-means test to identify chronic poor households in selected villages

- Transfers are provided directly to women
  - In polygamous households transfers are given to first wife
Niger: Cash Transfers + Accompanying Measures

• A “behavioral change component” (BCC, Volet Comportemental) seeks to foster behavioral changes among parents and encourage investments in young children’s human capital

• “Productive Accompanying Measures” to encourage the formation of women’s groups and informal saving mechanisms
  – Seek to facilitate investments in income-generating activities and diversification
In Niger, cash transfers + savings facilitation had sustained productive impacts 1.5 years after transfers ended

- Very poor beneficiary households take the opportunity to invest:
  - Investment in livestock: stock of animal increase by 50% (value= 62 000 FCFA, approximately 1/3 of transfers)

- Mostly in activities they are already engaged in:
  - Increases in agricultural productivity
  - No impacts on diversification in non-agricultural household enterprises

- Main mechanisms?
  - Participation in savings groups (tontines) remains stronger 18 months after the end of the transfers
  - Ability to invest in presence of risk or lumpy investments

- Provided a basis to further strengthen productive accompanying measures

---

![Impacts on livestock and participation in savings group 18 months after the end of transfers](chart.png)

- Beneficiaries
- Non Beneficiaries

8 March 2018
Designing an Integrated Package of accompanying measures for Productive Inclusion through the Sahel ASP Program
The Sahel Adaptive Social Protection Program (ASPP)

- Objective: increase access to effective adaptive social protection systems for poor and vulnerable populations in Burkina Faso, Chad, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, and Senegal.

- Funded by a Multi Donor Trust Fund Supported by DFID (£43m), AFD (EU6m) which complements a large bank IDA portfolio (US250m), and supports bank-executed technical assistance and analytical activities.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Project name</th>
<th>Number of beneficiaries</th>
<th>Government Funding</th>
<th>ASPP Funding</th>
<th>IDA/IBRD Funding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Social Safety Net Project</td>
<td>255,000</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad</td>
<td>Chad Safety Nets Project</td>
<td>15,200 (households)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Emergency Safety Nets Project</td>
<td>450,000</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Mauritania Social Safety Net System</td>
<td>25,000 (households)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>Niger Safety Net Project</td>
<td>126,500 (households)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>92.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Senegal Safety Net Operation</td>
<td>759,000</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>11.05</td>
<td>40.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How to design a comprehensive package of accompanying measures?

• **Collaborative effort**
  – Between Sahel ASPP teams across countries (Burkina Faso, Chad, Niger, Mali, Mauritania, Senegal)
  – Support from regional WB team and thematic experts

• **Multi-country impact evaluation**
  – To assess impact and draw lessons
Regional effort to design and learn from implementation of productive accompanying measures
Diagnostic and Analysis of constraints to more Productive Employment

• Qualitative tools
  – Toolkit used in Liberia and Côte d’Ivoire, adapted to assess constraints to more productive livelihoods for safety nets beneficiaries in the Sahel
  – Focus groups + key informant interviews
  – Contrasts: male//female; extreme poor//less poor; connected to//distant from markets
  – Themes: quality of Income-generating activities, constraints to productivity, priorities for interventions
  – Coverage: 5 countries

• Quantitative tools
  – Quantitative survey module with specialized quantitative tool to analyze constraints
  – Coverage: 3 countries

Consultations and Regional workshop to prioritize constraints and design productive accompanying measures based on local experience and studies
Diagnostic: Identification of constraints by country

Substantial overlap in constraints by country, points to core cross-cutting issues to tackle across countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Burkina</th>
<th>Mali</th>
<th>Mauritania</th>
<th>Niger</th>
<th>Senegal</th>
<th>Chad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Access to capital</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skills (technical and micro-entrepreneurship)</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Access to markets</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Access to inputs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Behaviors and aspirations</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social norms</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Others</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk management</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic infrastructure</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of production factors (rent, utilities)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8 March 2018
1. Creation of beneficiary groups and coaching
   - Creation of beneficiary groups (if not existing already)
   - Identification of coaches (community-level resource person) to accompany beneficiaries
     - Coaches facilitate mobilization
     - Coaches provide technical assistance to groups and individuals

2. Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLA/AVEC)
   - Adaptation of VSLA/AVEC model to integrate as part of safety nets programs.

3. Community sensitization on aspirations and social norms
   - Projection of a video documentary on individual successful with their productive investment
   - 1-2 discussions on aspirations and inclusion with the whole community
4. Life skills training
   - Group-based, 7 half-days course, targeted to illiterate populations
   - Addresses topics such as self-esteem and personal initiative, aspirations and social norms

5. Microentrepreneurship training
   - Group-based, 7 half-days course, targeted to illiterate populations
   - Cross-cutting transferable skills to manage agricultural / non-agricultural activities
   - Includes a simple planning tool for the use of the cash grant

6. Cash grants
   - One-off transfer of ~70% of yearly per capita consumption (80 000 FCFA)
   - Delivered in cash to individual beneficiaries: flexibility and practicality

7. Access to markets
   - Facilitation of group-buying of inputs
Implementation/Delivery arrangements

- Implementation modalities vary in each country. The regional ASPP activity provides technical assistance, facilitate development of tools and training of trainers.

- In Niger, the Safety Nets Unit includes a national office, offices in each region, and staff at the commune level (field operators).

- Field operators facilitate the selection of community-level resource people (coaches) by the communities, and train/supervise them.

- Community-level resource people facilitate savings group, coach beneficiaries and facilitate access to inputs.

- Community sensitizations are contracted to specialized facilitators.

- Micro-entrepreneurship and life skills trainings are contracted to specialized NGOs/trainers.

- Cash grants payments are performed through the payment system for the cash transfer program.
Delivery model in Niger

Key Coverage/Delivery Parameters
- 17 communes
- 249 villages
- 15,700 beneficiaries
- 28 Communal Field Workers
- 250 Community Resource People
- 6 facilitators for community sensitization
- 70 trainers for micro-entrepreneurship and life-skills training
Multi-country impact evaluation ongoing in 4 countries (Burkina Faso, Mauritania, Niger, Senegal).

Objectives: learning jointly about the effectiveness and optimal design of the productive package

Key Questions:
1. How effective is the package?
   – Measure value-added beyond providing cash transfers only

2. Are psycho-social interventions needed to facilitate productive inclusion of poor households?
   – Measure value-added of package with and without community sensitization on social norms and life skills training

3. What is the most cost-effective package?
   – Test with and without complementary cash grants
Options being piloted and tested – all delivered to existing cash transfer beneficiaries

T1: Social Package (core measures + psycho-social sensitization and training)

T2: Capital Package (Core measures + cash grants)

T3: Complete Package (Core measures + psycho-social sensitization and training + cash grants)

T0: Control without productive measures (No accompanying measures)